## Illegal Wildlife Trade (IWT) Challenge Fund Final Report

To be completed with reference to the "Writing a Darwin Report" guidance:

(<a href="http://www.darwininitiative.org.uk/resources-for-projects/reporting-forms">http://www.darwininitiative.org.uk/resources-for-projects/reporting-forms</a>). It is expected that this report will be a **maximum** of 20 pages in length, excluding annexes.

#### **IWT Challenge Fund Project Information**

Project reference	IWT042
Project title	Combatting global wildlife cybercrime: building on the success in China
Country(ies)	China, Viet Nam, Tanzania, Cameroon
Lead organisation	TRAFFIC International
Partner institution(s)	Tencent, SF-Express, China CITES Management Authority, Criminal Science and Technology Department, N1anjing Forest Police College, Cameroon CITES Management Authority, DHL eCommerce, Viet Nam E-commerce Association (VECOM), Viet Nam Automobile Transport Association (VATA), The Tanzania Truck Owners Association (TATOA)
Total IWT grant value	GBP 363,863
Start/end dates of project	1 July 2017- 30 June 2019
Project leader's name	XU Ling
Project website/blog/social media	
Report author(s) and date	Chen Jing & Xu Ling, 26 July, 2019

#### 1. Project Summary

Rapidly developing digital technology has brought monumental change to global commercial transactions. Yet, alongside the everyday benefits brought by evolving technology, the internet has also provided new channels for criminals to trade in illegal products, including species of wild and endangered fauna and flora. TRAFFIC's monitoring work for years has shown that the illegal wildlife trade in China has shifted from physical markets to online platforms such as e-commerce and is now moving towards social media platforms – with a worrying trend in the scale of illegal wildlife trade on Chinese social media. The courier/logistics industry is a crucial link between e-commerce buyers and sellers. Wildlife cybercrime, where products are trafficked by courier/logistics companies, has unique characteristics, including the anonymity offered to senders and receivers. The previous work in China has built some successes in capacity building and awareness raising for law enforcement agencies, internet and courier/logistic companies, which form the base of the project.

This project continued to address such increasing threats to wildlife posed by wildlife cybercrime associated with markets in China. Vietnam, Tanzania and Cameroon were also covered in this project; the magnitude of the illegal online wildlife trade in the two African countries being largely undocumented until now. By learning from China's experience, these important countries in the illegal trafficking chain can be effectively supported to combat such crimes.

The project is focused on eight species including tiger, elephant, rhino, hawksbill turtle, leopard, pangolin, saiga antelope and helmeted hornbill, all found to be commonly traded online in China. This list of focal species was subsequently expanded to include other species during the survey, including African lion, grey parrot, lovebird, shoebill, hornbill and other big cats originating from Africa.

An escalation of poaching in Southeast Asia and Africa to meet China's market demand for wildlife products affects local communities in many ways. This project has benefited people living in low-

income countries that are being subjected to poaching and trafficking of endangered species and their products, at the source of the trafficking chain. Poaching can impact negatively on livelihoods as security threats from poachers and traffickers has an adverse effect on tourism, as well as a devastating effect on wildlife populations and wider economic losses. The associated job opportunities arising from tourism are also compromised by illegal activity. Communities that reside in areas of where the poaching and trafficking of wildlife takes place are often disproportionately affected, often to the detriment of the majority. Illegal wildlife trade has been linked to weapon proliferation and violence in local communities, and the undermining of local governance structures and social stability. Women and children, who are particularly vulnerable in such situations, would be prime beneficiaries if the project outcomes are achieved.

There are other trickle-down benefits to reducing market demand and availability of illegal wildlife products, particularly in terms of the financial and manpower burden on law enforcement in range countries, e.g. Cameroon and Tanzania.

This project has wide-reaching impact on various different communities. Primary beneficiaries in China are the social media, e-commerce and the courier/logistics sectors as well as respective companies involved in the illegal transport of wildlife products out of China. The project helps to promote legal and transparent supply chains, and ultimately sustainable business development and corporate social responsibility, and may eventually help to foster good practices in transit and source countries as well.

A key outcome of the project is the enhancement of wildlife law enforcement capacity and overall compliance of law and regulations concerning the online trade in wildlife products. In this regard, the project has assisted governments in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania to carry out commitments to the CITES decisions (particularly 17.92 and 17.93) on 'Combating Wildlife Cybercrime', which were adopted during CITES CoP17.

Project activities have also supported existing efforts on-ground and in-country, including efforts conservation and civil society groups that are working to protect endangered species in Asia and Africa. For example, the project was embedded in TRAFFIC's work to strengthen Tanzania's judiciary (prosecutors and magistrates) on combating wildlife crime, identifying the involvement of the e-commerce and transport sector within this proposed project is a key step in that process.

The project has created new and needed partnerships to combat illegal wildlife trade partnerships. For example, in Tanzania where there was no partnership between the transport industry and wildlife conservation stakeholders (e.g., Tanzania CITES MA). The project also provided government agencies in Cameroon with capacity and tools to combat wildlife cybercrime – which they would not have without this project. After the project ends, TRAFFIC will continue to engage and promote partnerships with involved governments and businesses to continue to combat wildlife cybercrime. Lessons learned from the project are also being disseminated to a number of other key audiences, including representatives from source countries, other current consumer markets and conservation groups, enabling the building of knowledge amongst key partners and stakeholders in conservation. Additional funds are also being sought to build on the important successes achieved by this Defra IWT Challenge-supported project.

In general, the project has helped to break links between illegal wildlife buyers, sellers and poachers. Through increasing law enforcement and industry capacity and willingness to detect and respond to illegal wildlife trade in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania, the project has contributed to reducing that trade, and thereby make a significant contribution to wider combined efforts to reduce poaching and trafficking, and the associated risks to wildlife and security and livelihoods for local communities.

#### 2. Project Partnerships

During the preparation of this report, all relevant partners were engaged, and contributed to the outputs and impact of this project, while also expressing their interests in continuing to work with TRAFFIC on combating wildlife cybercrime in the future.

New partnerships were developed through the implementation of the project. For example, China Express Association (CEA) collaborated with TRAFFIC in co-hosting the International Forum for Logistic Industry and facilitating the signing of Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Thereof by Chinese Courier and Logistics companies on 7 May 2019. As one of the positive follow-ups, CEA invited TRAFFIC to co-organize a training workshop in Yunnan Province for front-line delivery services regarding the refusal to transport illegal wildlife cargo, held in June 2019. In Cameroon, the internet company Jumia and courier/logistic company DHL also showed strong interest in collaboration with TRAFFIC. In Tanzania,

the e-commerce companies Kupatana and Zudua showed interest in working with TRAFFIC and were engaged in participating to the international training event on combating online wildlife crime in Beijing, China in March 2019. The Kupatana General Manager attended the event. Likewise, the courier/logistic companies Next courier, Ryder Supply Chain Solutions Ltd, Leon, were also engaged to collaborate on the project and attend the training 'International Seminar of refusing delivering illegal wildlife & their products by Logistics and transportation industry' in Beijing, in May 2019. Unfortunately, none of them got their visa on time to attend the training, but all companies have been engaged face-to-face in-country, and have shown interest in continuing cooperation with TRAFFIC on anti-trafficking related activities, even beyond the project.

Other new partners involved in the project are:

- CITES Scientific Authority (SA), China: experts to give presentations at trainings workshops and provide TRAFFIC and business actors with expertise and experience on CITES and species identification.
- Helsinki University: Dr Enrico Mi who gave a presentation on machine learning in tackling illegal
  wildlife information on social media in the Coalition workshop in March 2019. He also worked with
  TRAFFIC in the US to support a training workshop on AI technology for combating illegal wildlife
  trade.
- WCO Reginal Intelligence Liaison Office (RILO) A/P: Mr. Wang Liang, Intelligence officer of WCO RILO A/P gave a presentation at both training events for internet companies and courier/logistics companies; WCO RILO A/P also invited TRAFFIC to attend its annual meeting in September 2018 in Solo, Indonesia. TRAFFIC gave a presentation on combating wildlife cybercrime and has continued to build a strong institutional partnership with WCO RILO A/P.
- WCO Reginal Office for Capacity Building: invited TRAFFIC to attend the training workshop and
  give presentation on combating wildlife cybercrime in Shanghai in November 2018. There are
  similar opportunities to continue this institutional partnership, and leverage TRAFFIC's global MoU
  with WCO to focus more on wildlife cybercrime.
- UNODC: An organized crime specialist from the regional office for Asia/Pacific contributed expertise to the Customs workshop organized by TRAFFIC in Suzhou, Jiangsu Province on 26 March 2019. Building on this first and successful collaboration in China, UNODC invited TRAFFIC to jointly organise China-VN border police enforcement training workshop in Hekou, Yunnan Province and Pingxiang, Guangxi Province on 17-28 June 2019.
- Cameroon Customs: representatives were invited to attend the Custom workshop in China in March 2019. Since early 2019, TRAFFIC is under discussion with Cameroon Customs for an MoU signing between the two organizations.
- Kupatana: a tech company from Tanzania was approached through the project, who joined the Coalition and became a good partner with TRAFFIC.
- Tanzania Customs: representatives were invited and actively participated in the Customs
  Workshop on combating wildlife crime in Suzhou, China in March 2019. Since this workshop,
  TRAFFIC has been able to strengthen its collaboration with Tanzania Customs, and has been
  working with them in the organization and delivery of two additional workshops on strengthening
  anti-trafficking activities at borders under two different projects.
- The Tanzania Federation of East Africa Road Transport Associations (FEARTA).
- The Tanzania Transporters Association of Tanzania (TAT).

The role of partners and lessons learnt are described as below.

Partner name	Roles and achievements & lessons	Follow-up
China CITES Management Authority (MA)	Roles: - Provided comments during the development of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for internet and courier/logistics companies; - Supported the formation of the China-based internet company alliance on combating wildlife cybercrime on 22 November 2017;	Good partnership was maintained, particularly in three aspects: 1) China CITES MA entrusted TRAFFIC to coordinate the Coalition to deal with IWT reported by the

	<ul> <li>Supported the one-year anniversary event of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online on 6 March 2019;</li> <li>Supported both domestic and international training events for law enforcement agencies to combat wildlife cybercrime;</li> <li>Shared China's experience in combating wildlife cybercrime at relevant international conferences.</li> <li>Achievements &amp; Lessons:</li> <li>It was important to have deeply engaged China CITES MA in the proposal development and project implementation, which has ensured their maximum buy-in and support;</li> <li>The close working relationship with China CITES MA enabled integration of this activity with the MA's annual work plan on the coordination of combating wildlife crime and interdepartmental/trans-boundary enforcement collaboration, which helped deliver the activities of this project to right audience at the right time.</li> </ul>	public; 2) China CITES MA entrusted TRAFFIC and Alibaba to develop the rules of legal wildlife trade online. In addition, through the implementation of other TRAFFIC's projects, the partnership with CITES MA in China has been further enhanced; and 3) China CITES MA was engaged in TRAFFIC's application for IWTCF 2019 Round 6 – Stage 1.
Criminal Science and Technology Department, Nanjing Forest Police College	Profes:  - Conducted research on combating wildlife cybercrime together with the National Forest Police Bureau and key social media and e-commerce companies;  - Helped to develop separate SOP manuals for social media and e-commerce companies and courier/logistics companies on detecting and combating illegal wildlife trade;  - Co-hosted domestic training events for enforcement officials and social media/e- commerce & courier/logistics companies in November 2017 and June 2018, as well as regional/international training for global social media, e-commerce and courier/logistics companies in March 2019.  Lessons:  - Building on the long-term cooperation with Prof. Zhou Yongwu from Nanjing Forest Police Bureau, TRAFFIC received technical support during the proposal development and project implementation.  - As the cradle of training forest police, this collaboration added a comprehensive understanding of global and domestic illegal wildlife trade and trafficking: critical components for relevant curriculum building and students' training.	The good partnership is maintained. In TRAFFIC's application for IWTCF 2019 Round 6, Prof. Zhou Yongwu and Nanning Forest Police College will continue to be key partners. In addition, TRAFFIC and Nanning Forest Police College have scheduled a joint law enforcement training event to combat illegal wildlife trade and trafficking.
Tencent	Provided valuable comments in developing a SOP manual on preventing and detecting illegal wildlife trade online;  - Co-hosted a review workshop to finalize the SOP and a training event for itself and other e-commerce companies on how to adopt the finalized the SOP in their daily work;  - Supported law enforcement training for China's law enforcement agencies on combat illegal wildlife trade online;  - Participated in global cybercrime events to share experiences.  Achievements & Lessons:  - Tencent together with Baidu and Alibaba led the formation of China-based Internet Company Alliance on Combating Wildlife Cybercrime on 22 November 2017. Two representatives from Tencent attended the Launch event for the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in San Francisco on 7 March 2018, and	TRAFFIC's professional and up-to-date knowledge on illegal wildlife trade online is a significant strength to maintain and consolidate the partnership with Tencent. More cooperation has been scheduled to combat illegal wildlife trade on social media platforms, and enhance customer education and public awareness raising as well.

	one of them in the industry panel shared Tencent's experience on how to effectively combat illegal wildlife trade in their platform;	
	- Supported by TRAFFIC and other NGOs, Tencent initiated a programme named "digital rescue" to combat illegal wildlife trade in their platform. "Digital rescue" was also included in its recent MoU with WWF China, which hosts TRAFFIC China.	
	-Tencent has collaborated with TRAFFIC and other NGOs to develop an express channel - "Tencent for the Planet" for the public to report illegal trade information of wildlife and other commodities. It is a professional and rapid system engaging online users, NGOs, individual identification experts and law enforcement agencies to crack down on wildlife cybercrime. NGOs and individual experts will help filter the data, and the suspicious information on illegal wildlife trade will be further investigated by Tencent. Following this, the actionable information will be submitted to law enforcement agencies. The above steps will take place within 72 hours and informers will received.	
SF-Express	Roles:  - Engaged in developing a SOP manual on detecting and deterring illegal wildlife products for the transportation sector;	Significantly, SF has been more active taking its own actions against illegal wildlife
	- Co-hosted a review workshop to finalise the manual and a training event for itself and other e-commerce companies on how to use the manual in their daily operations;	trade, as a result of its long-term engagement with TRAFFIC. As a
	- Supported law enforcement training for China's law enforcement agencies on combat illegal wildlife trade during the transportation;	follow-up of this project, TRAFFIC is working with SF-
	- Participated in relevant global events to share experiences, e.g. the first IWT symposium in Oxford;	Express in developing training materials for
	Achievements & Lessons:	SF-Express staff, particularly new staff
	- The participation of SF-Express in the training workshop in Nanjing on the week of 27 November 2017 helped law enforcement officers better understand how criminals illegally deliver wildlife products through the express channel and how SF-Express made efforts on preventing, detecting and combating illegal wildlife trade during transportation. Through this workshop, SF-Express and wildlife enforcement agencies established the communication system which will directly support the investigation of wildlife seizure cases for the next step.	or those working at important international border locations.
	- The participation of SF-Express in the first IWT symposium in Oxford in September 2017 helped the audience from various countries learn about China's success in business engagement in addressing IWT holistically by addressing supply chains together with customer demand;	
	-SF signed the Voluntary Code of Practice and shared its experiences with other courier/logistics companies during the Logistic Event in May 2019.	
DHL	Roles: -Worked with TRAFFIC to enhance the ability of DHL staff to detect shipments of illegal wildlife A key signatory to the United for Wildlife Transport Taskforce Buckingham Palace Declaration. DHL can be considered to be a sectoral champion in combating wildlife traffickingproviding its in-house expertise and will share lessons learnt in the review process of the SOP Manual.	As DHL is widely distributed in the world and playing an important role in combating illegal wildlife trade during the transportation, TRAFFIC offices are working with DHL to organise more training
	Achievements & Lessons: - Two training workshops for DHL in Shanghai and Shenzhen were delivered in March 2019 to reduce illegal wildlife trade from	workshops to increase their capacity building

	supply chains.	on the existing
	- DHL signed the Voluntary Code in May 2019.	collaboration.
Cameroon CITES	Roles:	The trust between
Management Authority	-Provided the framework and enable environment for the effective implementation of the proposed project.	TRAFFIC and Cameroon CITES MA has been built and
	-Be responsible for convening and chairing the meetings of the project stakeholders	consolidated through long-term
	-Institutionalised wildlife cybercrime monitoring as an additional mechanism for the fight against IWT as a result of its involvement in the project.	communication. Government agencies in Cameroon have acknowledged the
	- Supported the training and or dissemination of the two SOPs related to e-commerce and courier/logistics companies that have been translated into French.	work of TRAFFIC and shown the willingness to work with TRAFFIC,
	Achievements & Lessons:	and thereby contribute to public-private sector
	- The Cameroon CITES National Implementation Committee including CITES MA, Customs, Police, Justice and many other competent administrations worked with TRAFFIC Central Africa to revamp the above-mentioned committee in the fight against illegal wildlife trade. This committee had stopped functioning since 2008. The launching meeting of this committee was organized on 27 April 2018.	partnerships on combating cybercrime.
	- A new strategy in combatting wildlife crime was developed thanks to the support of TRAFFIC, IUCN, WWF and ZSL; TRAFFIC will continue its support in order to disseminate the developed strategy to all stakeholders in the country.	
Cameroon	Roles:	The trust between
Customs	- Supported the control of illegal activities happening at borders involving courier, logistics and transport companies.	TRAFFIC and Cameroon Customs has been built and
	- Supported the training and or dissemination of the two SOPs related to e-commerce and courier/logistics companies that have been translated into French.	consolidated through long-term communication.
	Achievement & Lessons:	Government agencies in Cameroon have
	- The participation in the international training event in Suzhou, China in March 2019 has helped Cameroon Customs better understand how to combat illegal wildlife trade online.	acknowledged the work of TRAFFIC and shown the willingness
	- A proposed MoU between TRAFFIC and Cameroon Customs has been reviewed and under final consideration.	to focus on breaking supply chains linked to wildlife cybercrime.
Viet Nam E- commerce Association (VECOM)	Roles: - Provided their support to review and localize the SOP manual for social media and e-commerce companies, as well as to promote its adoption and use in Viet Nam Helped organize representatives from local online companies to attend training events in China on preventing and detecting illegal wildlife trade online, and to participate in a study tour in China where they can engage with enforcement officials, social media and e-commerce champions in China.  Achievements & Lessons: - TRAFFIC's Viet Nam programme office continues to have a good working relationship with VECOM and its members. In November 2017, TRAFFIC provided information from this project to VECOM members and proposed an SOP manual for development in the near future Representatives from VECOM attended the Coalition event in Beijing in March 2019.	VECOM is an important partner for TRAFFIC's work in Viet Nam. More work will be done by TRAFFIC to strengthen the collaboration with VECOM to combat wildlife cybercrime.

Viet Nam Automobile Transport Association (VATA)	Roles: - Engaged in reviewing and localising the SOP for courier/logistics companies, as well as promoting the adoption and use of the SOP in Viet Nam Sent representatives from Viet Nam to the SOP training events in China, and to participate in a study tour in China where they will engage with enforcement officials and courier/logistics champions in China.  Achievements & Lessons: - After long-term communication with VATA, TRAFFIC succeeded in persuading VATA to re-confirm its commitment to adopted corporate social responsibility policies on promoting wildlife conservation Representatives from VATA attended the logistics event in Beijing in May 2019 and promised to share China's experience	The representative from VATA who attended the event in Beijing spoke highly for TRAFFIC's work in China. TRAFFIC will continue to support VATA to take actions in combating IWT for the next step.
Private Sector in Tanzania:  The Tanzania Truck Owners Association (TATOA)  Federation of East Africa Road Transport Associations  Tanzania Private Sector Foundation Board  Tanzania Freight and Logistics Platform	with Vietnamese transportation companies.  Roles:  - Helping to reach out representatives from local e-companies and logistics/courier companies to collaborated to the project and attend training events in China.  -Engaging in reviewing and localizing the SOP for courier/logistics companies, as well as promoting the adoption and use of the SOP in Tanzania.  -Sending representatives from the courier/logistics companies to SOP training events in China.  Achievements:  -The project, its executive summary and the logframe, have been presented to the other private organizations mentioned above.  - Three e-companies, and three courier/logistics companies were approached and engaged.  - One e-commerce company attended the Coalition event in Beijing, in March 2019, and received the SOP.  - Three courier/logistics companies planned to attend the training event in Beijing, in May 2019, but their representatives failed to get their visas on time. However, all have accepted to receive the SOPs and to implement them.  - Strengthened collaboration between TRAFFIC and Tanzania private sector, and engagement of Tanzania transport and courier/logistics sectors in other TRAFFIC projects.	The engagement with logistics and transportation companies in Tanzania will continue to be enhanced beyond the project period
Tanzania CITES Management Authority, and Tanzania anti- poaching and anti-trafficking Task Force	Roles: -provided the framework and enabling environment for the effective implementation of the proposed projectrecognised wildlife cybercrime monitoring as an additional mechanism for the fight against IWT as a result of its involvement in the project.  Achievements: The Tanzania CITES MA and the national Task Force, have used the results of the online surveys to initiate an investigation on Grey Parrot illegal trade. This investigation is currently still ongoing.	

Tanzania	Roles:	
Customs	- Supported the control of illegal activities happening at borders involving courier, logistics and transport companies.	
	Achievements:	
	- Participated in the Customs Workshop on combating wildlife crime in Suzhou, China on March 2019.	
	- Strengthened collaboration between TRAFFIC and Tanzania Customs, and engagement of Tanzania Customs in other TRAFFIC projects.	

#### 3. Project Achievements

#### 3.1 Outputs

All the four outputs set in the project have been achieved based on evaluations of the project against the logical framework. The achievements are specified as follows. More detailed information can be found in Annex 2.

**OUTPUT 1** Understanding of, and commitments to cracking down on wildlife cybercrimes in, and linked to, markets in China. Viet Nam. Cameroon and Tanzania, including key locations and trade routes.

This output focuses increasing the knowledge base on wildlife cybercrime in the target countries, as well as the capacity of the project team, law enforcement agencies, internet companies and courier/logistics companies in cracking down on wildlife cybercrimes. The achievement of the output can be substantiated through the production of reports detailing the results of online surveys in China, Vietnam, Tanzania and Cameroon (see supporting materials No. 3,4,5,6), the global wildlife cybercrime analysis report (supporting material No.7), and the dissemination of this information to various stakeholders. The achievement of OUTPUT 1 is very important in providing the evidence base to support activities in the other project outputs.

The capacity of TRAFFIC offices in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania in monitoring and detecting wildlife cybercrime has been improved as a result of training on online survey methodology by TRAFFIC China staff. All offices subsequently carried out surveys of the respective online markets using a standardised methodology. Reports of the survey findings provide the baseline information for future assessments of online markets, which is especially vital in Tanzania and Cameroon, where online shopping is rapidly developing.

The report of "Combating Wildlife Crime Linked to the Internet: Global Trend and China's Experiences" has been completed and published on the TRAFFIC website. The report examines the characteristics of wildlife cybercrime, reviews the state of policies worldwide and actions taken thus far by international organizations, while discussing the lessons learnt in China to combat such crimes. Suggestions for actions are also provided in the report.

Research undertaken through the project has been shared with government agencies, and internet and logistic/courier companies, in order to improve understanding of illegal wildlife trade online, and to facilitate regulators to take enforcement action.

One of the key achievements of the project as recognised by the stakeholders that have been engaged is the strategy used to tackle wildlife cybercrime. A collaborative and industry-led approach was adopted as an effective method for motivating actions by the private sector. TRAFFIC first pioneered this approach in November 2017 in its collaborations with China's three internet giants – Baidu, Alibaba and Tencent – who formed an alliance to cooperate on combating wildlife cybercrime. This approach in garnering industry action was quickly expanded a few months later with the formation of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online, a global initiative that included leading tech companies such as Google, eBay and Facebook, in pledging to work together to reduce wildlife trafficking across platforms in March 2018. As of July 2019, the Coalition has 32 participating companies, and includes companies from project-relevant countries, i.e. Kupatana from Tanzania and Sapo from Viet Nam. These strategic achievements have been reported in Defra's IWT Newsletter three times (supporting material No.28,29)

TRAFFIC has modelled this industry collaboration approach with the courier and logistics sector in China. In May 2019, TRAFFIC/WWF coordinated the signing of a Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Products Thereof by 14 leading courier and logistics companies in China, jointly committing to curbing illegal wildlife trade in their operations. Representatives from Viet Nam attended the

event and spoke highly for the actions taken by Chinese courier and logistic companies and an intention to apply these practices on return to Viet Nam. (supporting material No.27)

**OUTPUT 2** Improved law enforcement commitments and efforts to combat wildlife cybercrime in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania

Improvements in commitment and effort by law enforcement in combating wildlife cybercrime are reflected in the success of enforcement actions in the target countries, as well as the recognition by law enforcement agencies on the seriousness of wildlife cybercrime.

One of the biggest seizures made in China that directly relates to wildlife trafficking online occurred in March 2019 with the crackdown of two online platforms called Dimili and Rigouwang, that was used for smuggling illegal wildlife products overseas. Furthermore, there were a total of four law enforcement actions arising from the efforts of this project in China. Two of these investigations have been completed with more than 20kg ivory seized and two are still under investigation. An ongoing case on Grey Parrot smuggling in Tanzania had been initiated with information provided by TRAFFIC from online survey data collected during the project.

A Customs training event, co-organised by TRAFFIC and China Customs, was conducted in Suzhou, China, in March 2019. There were 10 international delegates from law enforcement agencies in Viet Nam (4), Cameroon (3) and Tanzania (3) in attendance, as well as 50 Customs officials from 8 other countries, including China. The workshop achieved its objectives in building capacity for law enforcement agencies from China and other target countries, though the workshop also helped to foster cross-agency connections, which are key ingredients for future collaborations (supporting material No.9). The activity was reported in the Defra IWT newsletter and well acknowledged (supporting material No.30).

The project also cultivated knowledge sharing through the granting of travel funds for key individuals in law enforcement agencies to speak at international forums. Ms. SHEN Xinlu from China Customs was able to attend the 28th Meeting of the INTERPOL Wildlife Crime Working Group in Singapore on 9-13 October 2017, presenting on the experience of China Customs in combating wildlife crime, and the collaborative approach taken with NGOs such as TRAFFIC and with the internet and logistics sectors (supporting material No.10). One representative from China Customs attended the launch event for the formation of Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in San Francisco on 7 March 2018, and was able to build connections with USFWS and US Department of State through subsequent meetings to discuss the status and challenges of combating wildlife cybercrime in China and US (supporting material No.11).

**OUTPUT 3** Enhanced capacity to prevent and detect illegal wildlife trade by owners/operators of e-commerce and social media platforms in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania

The project's aim to deepen engagement with internet companies and enhance their capacity to prevent and detect illegal wildlife trade was achieved through the regular sharing of survey data identifying illegal wildlife trade on their platforms, provision of tools such as the best-practice example of a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) and support through trainings and workshops.

TRAFFIC developed the SOP manual for the detection and combatting of illegal wildlife trade online based on past collaborations with the internet and logistics companies in China (supporting material No.17). The SOP has been shared widely with internet companies in China through trainings and workshops. The manual was also translated into English, Vietnamese, Kiswahili and French (supporting material No.18) to support mainstreaming of these guidelines, which have been shared with relevant companies in the project's target countries.

Since the completion of the SOP in Chinese and translation into English, trainings on its use have provided at two international events. These include a training event in March 2018 held at the Baidu headquarters in Beijing, and the one-year anniversary event of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in Beijing on 6-7 March 2019. Both events included the participation of international partners such as the CITES Secretariat, as well as international NGO partners including IFAW, WildAid, WCS and NRDC. The SOP was also shared with various Chinese national government agencies at the Coalition event in March 2019, including China's National Forestry and Grassland Administration (NFGA), the Anti-smuggling Bureau of the General Administration of China Customs (GACC), National Forest Police Bureau, Office of the Central Cyberspace Affairs Commission, Market Supervision Bureau, and the Fisheries Bureau. Overseas government representatives from the European Union, and embassies of UK and USA, GIZ–the German development agency, were also informed of the SOP Manual.

As mentioned above, the collaborative and industry-led approach in working with internet companies (i.e. establishment of the Coalition) has proven successful in influencing the industry and encouraging them to become vigilant in their actions to crack down on illegal wildlife trade online.

Capacity building for internet companies through this project has also led to greater vigilance about illegal wildlife trading on their platforms, which may have contributed to the decline in online advertisement for illegal wildlife on target websites in China.

**OUTPUT 4** Enhanced capacity to deter wildlife trafficking by courier/logistics companies in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania.

The project also resulted in furthering engagement with courier and logistics companies. Similar to Output 3, the capacity of courier/logistics companies to combat wildlife cybercrime were enhanced through trainings and workshops organized by TRAFFIC.

A SOP for the courier/logistic sector was developed (supporting material No.22) and translated into English, Vietnamese, Kiswahili and French (supporting material No.23), for wider sharing with relevant stakeholders in the target countries.

Four trainings and workshops were organised during the project period, with more than 400 staff from China's courier and logistics companies being trained on the SOP manual (supporting material No. 24,25,26,27). A highlight of engagement with this sector under the project was the International Forum held in Beijing in May 2019, where 14 courier/logistics companies signed a Voluntary Code of Conduct. Participants from two Vietnamese companies were also present at the International Forum. As part of the sustainability of this project, the SOP Manual will continue to be advocated by TRAFFIC for use by the companies signing on to the Code of Conduct, as a way to meet the commitments therein.

The International Forum in May 2019 was furthermore attended by various international partners including FIATA, WCO, CITES Secretariat, the Royal Foundation (presented by the British Embassy in Beijing), German Embassy, as well as international NGOs IFAW and WildAid. Present to share insights about China's progress and challenges include representatives from the National Forest and Grassland Administration, State Post Bureau, China's CITES MA, Guangzhou Airport Customs and the Nanjing Forest Police College. The SOP, and experiences from the project, were well shared and distributed to international organizations.

#### 3.2 Outcome

**Outcome:** By equipping social media/e-commerce/courier/logistics companies and law enforcement agencies with tools to break links between illegal wildlife buyers and sellers and increasing enforcement and industry capacity in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania, the project will increase detection and action against cybercrime, thereby reducing associated threats to people and wildlife.

Four indicators were developed to evaluate the achievement of the project's outcomes. They include measurable declines in online advertisement for products of eight wildlife taxa on 31 platforms in China; a similar decline in advertisements for wildlife products in the other target countries; an increase in seizures of wildlife sold online in China; and the adoption of SOPs by internet and courier/logistics companies in the target countries. Outcome targets were especially ambitious in China, which plays a bigger role and influence in illegal wildlife trade globally.

Declines in online advertisements of the selected wildlife products were found when measured near the end of the project period. Monthly surveys in China by TRAFFIC found that the average number of new wildlife product advertisements during the period 2017-2018 had declined by 73%, compared to 2012-2016 levels. On social media platforms, the average number of daily advertisements declined by 25% in 2018 compared to 2017 levels, with daily active users reducing by 22% (supporting material No. 3-2). Changes in the wildlife product advertisements were harder to perceive in Cameroon and Tanzania. Indeed, the survey was able to identify a few advertisements during the two one-off surveys in 2017 and 2018. Although internet adoption is rapidly increasing in these countries, the penetration rate is still comparably low. Despite this, the project work in these countries provided the crucial opportunity to stem illegal wildlife trade activities online before it has had the opportunity to flourish, through the project's work in engaging with internet and courier companies. Survey data also serves as useful baseline data for comparison with future studies in this growing region.

The project provided an important boost to law enforcement activities. As mentioned above, there are four enforcement actions on wildlife crime linked to the internet in China due to intelligence reported by

TRAFFIC. Among those, there are two actions completed with more than 20kg ivory and the other two are still under investigation. However, determining the change in the number of wildlife seizures offered for sale online has proven difficult. News reports may not always include details of where illegal products were first found, hence the difficulty in establishing the total number of relevant seizures. Not all seizures that have occurred are reported, hence aggregates of published reports are likely to be an underestimate of the total.

The reach of the project in engaging with companies from in the internet and courier/logistics sectors has surpassed initial expectations of a minimum 15 companies. The main approach for encouraging the acceptance and use of the SOP manuals developed for the internet and logistics sectors is via a collaborative and voluntary approach for companies to join an industry alliance to tackle illegal wildlife trade online. TRAFFIC's engagement with internet companies started in November 2017, with 11 Internet companies in China forming an alliance to work jointly on combating wildlife cybercrime. A few months, collaborations between internet companies were expanded through the founding of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online, which to date includes 32 member companies, of which 19 are Chinese companies, with 1 company each from Viet Nam and Tanzania. However, the impact of actions taken by companies in the Coalition is subject to evaluation during and subsequent to the year 2020, and is beyond the scope of the current project to assess.

Similarly, the recent signing of the Voluntary Code of Practice to refuse delivery of illegal wildlife and products thereof, by 14 leading courier and logistics companies (from China and global) in May 2019, translates to similar commitments. The SOP manual for the courier and logistics companies provides a set of guidance for companies to implement and meet the commitments under the Code of Practice. While TRAFFIC has been collaborating with companies such as EMS and SF-Express to address illegal wildlife trade within their operations, perceivable changes to company policies and a more vigilant culture towards detecting illegal wildlife products may take a longer time to be established, especially with companies that were recently engaged for the Code of Practice. However, the impact of this collaboration amongst the Chinese couriers and logistics companies cannot be assessed within the project period due to the short timeframe between the signing of the Code of Conduct and project end date.

#### 3.3 Impact: achievement of positive impact on illegal wildlife trade and poverty alleviation

The intended *IMPACT* of this project is expected that significant reduction in wildlife cybercrime in China, especially for species surveyed from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania, will lead to reduced poaching, as well as increases in security and wildlife-based livelihood opportunities for rural communities.

The project was initially designed to address a major shift that was occurring in illegal wildlife trade, where trade was moving from physical markets to online platforms. This shift occurring in China has been well-documented by TRAFFIC in the assessments conducted in 2015 and 2016, which found a growing prevalence of wildlife products advertised on e-commerce websites, as well as a move to social media platforms. With similar rapid growth in internet penetration in other countries around the world, the project sought to capture similar movements of illegal wildlife trade to online markets. The surveys conducted as part of this project were therefore key to assessing the prevalence of online trade in the four target countries. Surveys were also pivotal as it provided a measurement of impact (whether reductions in new wildlife product advertisements have occurred), in which the other activities in the project would have contributed to. Indeed, the project found advertisements for illegal wildlife product online in China has significantly declined during the project period, for the project's target species on 31 websites and social media platforms. Although the reduction in wildlife product advertisements reflected the effort from website managers as well as effective enforcement actions, the project's other activities that aimed to engage and train enforcement officials and internet companies may have contributed to boosting their effort.

A more direct impact of the project's surveys is the creation of intelligence information through consistent surveys, which had been shared with enforcement agencies and internet companies to take further actions, including the deletion of illegal wildlife advertisements. These efforts have led to a tightening of the market for illegal wildlife products. As a major centre of demand for wildlife from Viet Nam, Tanzania and Cameroon, it is believed that the significant reduction of cybercrime in China will lead to the reduction of poaching in (and trafficking from) other countries, while increasing the security and wildlife-based livelihood opportunities for rural communities.

Trainings and workshops accomplished within the project have increased law enforcement commitment and effort in China, as well as in joint international enforcement collaboration. A clear example of this was a training held in Suzhou, China in March 2019. The training encouraged interactions between Customs counterparts from different countries, with networking and inter-agency connections likely to have benefits in terms of future transnational cooperation well beyond the project period. Wildlife cybercrime is

increasingly being recognized by law enforcement agencies in the project's four target countries, leading to enforcement actions linked to the internet being taken during the project period. For example, enforcement actions from China Customs have results in big seizures of elephant ivory and rhino horn, as well as the crackdown of two online platforms in April 2019.

The project's unique collaborative approach in the formation industry alliances to tackle illegal wildlife trade online has already generated impact in driving policy and operational changes in internet companies. Since the creation of an alliance of internet companies in China in November 2017, and the global coalition in March 2018, companies have made commitments to take down illegal wildlife posts on their platforms and are making concerted actions to prevent the posting and searching of such products. By catalyzing collaborations between these major internet companies in various countries and initiatives within their own platforms, significant flow-on effects would likely result in terms of raising the awareness of users about endangered wildlife and the risks in engaging with illegal wildlife trade online. Companies are already exploring high-tech tools such as machine learning to assist in intercepting illegal wildlife advertisements. Tencent, for example, has approached it by creating a platform for the public to report illegal trade information, as part of the "Tencent for the Planet" initiative. NGOs and individual experts help filter the submitted information, with suspicious activities further investigated by Tencent, which it commits to doing within 72 hours of receiving the information, and onwards to law enforcement agencies for action.

Importantly, this collaborative approach has created a sense of obligation by individual companies to meet their commitments under the Coalition and is having the intended effect of encouraging companies to remain vigilant and keep pace with others in the industry. Furthermore, the project's focus on countries such as Cameroon and Tanzania, where trading on the internet is in its early stages but likely to rapidly expand in the coming years, should help to assist burgeoning internet companies in these countries to leapfrog obstacles through learning and adopting best practices developed in China and elsewhere.

The project also achieved a big milestone in its engagement with courier/logistic companies. Following from the example of the internet companies, TRAFFIC was successful in establishing a partnership with the China Express Association to encourage 14 leading courier and logistics companies in China to sign a Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Products Thereof. The SOP has a key role to play in helping these companies meet their commitments under the Code of Conduct, by creating the pathways to making the internal company changes to effectively counteract attempts to make use of their services to transport illegal wildlife. SF-Express, for example, has been leading the change in the industry, having integrated the SOP produced through this project into its training application for staff. Investment to develop the SOP will have an impact well beyond the life of this project, as initiatives such as the code of conduct and continued engagement by TRAFFIC with companies in this sector encourage the adoption of the SOP, which will contribute to the overall impact of cutting the flow of illegal wildlife trade.

#### 4. Monitoring of assumptions

Assumptions	Comments
Outcome level	
Chinese leadership has strong political will to realise China's development of an "Ecological Civilization", particularly Customs, forest police and other relevant government agencies who will continue to place a high priority on tackling wildlife crime, including cybercrimes.	Yes. In March 2018, the 13 <sup>th</sup> National People's Congress voted and approved the "Amendment to the Constitution of the People's Republic of China" and "Ecological Civilization" was officially included in the Constitution. The relevant government agencies will continue to place a high priority on tackling wildlife crime. For example, initiated by Forest Police, the annual special enforcement action named "Spring Thunder" had been organized to combat wildlife-related crimes, including illegal wildlife trade online in 2018.
E-commerce and social media remain willing to make good on their commitments to combat wildlife cybercrime and show a willingness to participate in trainings.	Yes. The members of China-based internet company alliance against wildlife cybercrime will continue to work with TRAFFIC to take effective measures to reduce wildlife trafficking across their platforms.
Law enforcement agencies are willing to respond to, and able to report back on results of investigations linked to intelligence packages provided by TRAFFIC and industry partners.	Yes. For example, TRAFFIC, China's Forest Police and Tencent have established a special communication channel for intelligence sharing and enforcement action feedback.

Courier/logistics companies remain willing to make good on their commitments to combat wildlife trafficking and show a willingness to participate in trainings, etc.	Yes. Courier/logistics companies are willing to commit to combating wildlife cybercrime and actively attend the training TRAFFIC organized.
Output level	
Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and other countries are interested and engaged in the project and in monitoring online wildlife trade.	Yes. As indicated in the partnership progress, partners in these countries are interested and being engaged in the project.
Law enforcement officials in China continue to prioritise actions to combat increasing global illegal wildlife trade online, and are willing to cooperate with TRAFFIC, social media companies and e-commerce companies to combat wildlife cybercrime	Yes. During the project implementation, law enforcement officials were actively engaged in TRAFFIC's activities, e.g. training workshops and adopting enforcement follow-up based on the intelligence from TRAFFIC and internet companies.
Law enforcement officials in Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries show interest and are willing to learn from China on combating wildlife cybercrime	Yes. In Tanzania, the WD-MNRT, which chairs the National Wildlife and Forest Crime Task Force, has been aware of the project and is willing to support it; in Cameroon, TRAFFIC has already collaborated with enforcement agencies in the frame of the AFRICA TWIX project and TRAFFIC will introduce information originating from online survey for the next step.
BAT (Baidu, Alibaba and Tencent) continue to pay attention to increasing global illegal wildlife trade online, and are dedicated to cooperating with TRAFFIC and enforcement agencies to combat wildlife cybercrime	Yes. BAT is leading China's internet alliance against wildlife cybercrime and also part of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking online. They committed to reducing illegal wildlife trade in their platforms by 80% by 2020.
Law enforcement agencies are able to report back on results of investigations linked to intelligence packages provided by TRAFFIC and industry partners	Yes. TRAFFIC has maintained a good relationship with law enforcement agencies, who agree to share the final results with TRAFFIC as the investigation is completed. Details will be reported in future.
Courier/logistics companies, particularly the Top 10 who made a pledge to reject illegal wildlife trade (e.g. SF-Express) commits to combating illegal wildlife trafficking.	Yes. During the project implementation, SF-Express and TRAFFIC contacted frequently to discuss the organization of international training event for courier/logistics companies from other countries. EMS included the content of combating wildlife cybercrime in their regular staff training.
The SOP manual on detecting and combating illegal wildlife products during transportation will be accepted and implemented by courier/logistics companies in China and identified priorities countries	Yes. it has been approved to be true with the good partnership and collaboration with China Express Association.
Supported by other TRAFFIC offices, courier/logistic companies in other priority countries also commit to combating wildlife trafficking	Yes. TRAFFIC offices in Viet Nam, Tanzania and Cameroon have contacted local courier/logistics companies, who have shown great interest in learning from China to combat wildlife trafficking by adopting the SOP and attending the international training in China.

## 5. Project support to the IWT Challenge Fund Objectives and commitments under the London Declarations and Kasane Statement

The project has mainly addressed Objective 2, strengthening law enforcement. It contributed to the commitments from London Conference Declaration 2014, Kasane Statement and Hanoi Conference as follows. It also contributed to the London Conference Declaration 2018.

#### The London Conference Declaration 2014:

- IV: the project promoted engagement with internet and courier/logistic companies in China and Viet Nam in combating wildlife cybercrime by capacity building.
- XIII: the trainings and workshop for law enforcement agencies conducted in the project increases capacity building for law enforcement.
- XV: information and intelligence based on surveys were provided in a timely manner to relevant government agencies.

• XVI: joint enforcement actions between China and other Asian and African countries were addressed through the Customs training workshop.

#### The Kasane Statement 2015:

 1: the formation of the Coalition for internet companies, the singing of the Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Products Thereof, enhancing the partnership with internet and courier/logistic companies and strengthening the alliance of the internet and courier/logistic industries.

#### The Hanoi Statement 2016:

- Annex A: the project encourages government agencies in China to cooperate with internet and courier/logistics enterprises in combating wildlife cybercrime.
- Annex C: the project provides capacity building trainings for law enforcement agencies.
- Annex D: the project shares Chinese best practice models globally.

#### The London Conference Declaration 2018

- 14) the project contributes to capacity building for government agencies, especially for law enforcement agencies.
- 16) the project engages with internet and logistic companies, enhancing collaboration among government, private sector, and NGOs, and continuing to scale up the impact of the Global Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online.
- 18) the project increases the collaboration on combating wildlife trafficking between China and Viet Nam.

#### 6. Impact on species in focus

There are eight species the project is working on: tiger, elephant, rhino, hawksbill turtle, leopard, pangolin, saiga antelope and helmeted hornbill. All these species are classified as threatened on the IUCN Red List due to population declines. Poaching and trafficking to supply Chinese markets is one of the major factors in their decline. Through this project, China, together with Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania tried to scale-up efforts and collaborate to crack illicit supply chains and reduce the availability of endangered wildlife products in the online platforms of these four countries. This has also directly assisted these countries in their commitment towards implementing the CITES Decisions 17.92-96 on "Combating Wildlife Cybercrime," and then ultimately influenced the conservation of CITESlisted species, particularly the endangered species in this proposed project. According to informal communications with law enforcement agencies in China, there were four law enforcement actions directly arising from the efforts of this project. Two of these investigations have been completed with more than 20kg ivory seized and the other two incidents are still under investigation. It should be noted that intelligence information given to law enforcement agencies often has a lengthy lag time between the initial sharing of information to prosecution action, up to 2 years or more in arrears. Hence much of the data and information shared through this project could yield enforcement and prosecutorial results beyond the project period. The law enforcement actions and successful seizures have additionally raised the deterrent and made clear the consequences to individuals and companies involved in illegal wildlife trade.

The long-term impact of this project will be a reduction in the incentives that drive poaching to supply illegal wildlife markets in Asia, and thereby reduce poaching levels overall. This will in turn support the stabilization, and then recovery, of the identified species populations, reducing a major threat to their native ecosystem. Hence it will support the restoration of the ecological balance of respective habitats

#### 7. Project support to poverty alleviation

This project will benefit people living in low-income countries that are being subjected to poaching and trafficking of endangered species and their products, at the source of the trafficking chain. An escalation of poaching in Southeast Asia and Africa to meet China's markets for wildlife products affects local communities in many ways. It can impact negatively on livelihoods as security threats from poachers and traffickers has an adverse effect on tourism, as well as a devastating effect on wildlife populations and wider economic losses. The associated job opportunities arising from tourism would also be compromised. Communities that reside in areas of where the poaching and trafficking of wildlife takes place are often disproportionately affected, often to the detriment of the majority. Illegal wildlife trade has been linked to weapon proliferation and violence in local communities, and the undermining of local governance structures and social stability. Women and children, which are particularly vulnerable in such situations, would be prime beneficiaries if the project outcomes are achieved.

#### 8. Consideration of gender equality issues

The project implementation strictly complied with TRAFFIC's non-discrimination policy in relation to gender. The project staff includes a proportional balance of both women and men. A gender sensitive approach had

been taken in designing research activities, and in the design and delivery of the SOPs and associated training materials. During the project implementation, TRAFFIC achieved gender balance with regards to participation in and leadership/facilitation of project meetings, workshops and other events.

#### 9. Lessons learnt

The project has been completed well with some outstanding impacts. It was very challenging with a relatively new topic that covered four target countries from Asia and Africa and three key stakeholder groups. The implementation of the project required a lot of coordination, communication, collaboration and innovation. It was ambitious to carry out so many activities within two years.

Approaches to administration and management have been effective following TRAFFIC standard procedures. Facilitated by TRAFFIC China, a monthly skype call has been scheduled within the project team to update the progress as well as to discuss questions during the project period between all participating offices.

The communication with Defra has also been very important. Any change of staff and project activities has been submitted as requests to the Defra focal point in a timely fashion. Based on the good donor communications, approval was given very quickly. Meanwhile, the project leader also shared significant achievements from the project with the donor, and contributed activity progress to the IWT newsletter for wider distribution. This helped reach other Defra IWT grantees as well as a wider audience.

As the project started three months later than proposed, it was challenging for the project team to complete the activities on time. In the future, the project team needs to better forecast activities to be completed within a shorter term, especially for international events that require a lot of coordination efforts.

It would be good if the donor could have more clearer guidance on M&E. For example, a M&E report with suggested template would be much more practical for measuring project progress.

#### 9.1 Monitoring and evaluation

A comprehensive monitoring and evaluation plan was created at the start of the project based on the IWT Challenge logical framework. Progress was monitored throughout the project period against the logframe using identified measurable indicators of project outcomes and outputs. Building on the intermediate results established at the end of Year 1 (as reported in the 2018 Annual Report), output indicators were also measured during Year 2 at 6-monthly intervals. Furthermore, the M&E leader participated in quarterly discussions of project activities and monthly review calls with the Project Implementation Team. This helped to ensure a routine approach in assessing planned timeframes for activities as set out in the logframe against time requirements of real-world implementation, as well as a review of assumptions, and the need for adaptive management.

In addition, under TRAFFIC's regular project review system, this project in its entirety was reviewed by senior staff to assess for timeliness on deliverables, effectiveness of external relationships, impact to conservation and expected outcomes, project legacy and sustainability and budget efficiency.

In sum, there were no major changes needed in project design, with all outputs being delivered by the end of the project period as planned. However, it is acknowledged that the achievement of some project outputs might not be accurately assessed at the current point in time, an issue that is detailed in other parts of the current report (see Section 3 and Annex 2). For example, law enforcement actions generated as a result of the project's research, monitoring, training and engagements (Output 2) were a challenge to gauge during the project period. This is largely due to the long lead-time required for investigations between intelligence gathering and prosecutions, much of which is unlikely to be captured during the 2-year project period.

Staff changes did affect the timeliness of activities being delivered. The transition of a core implementing staff in Cameroon took a matter of months, and this led to some delays in the finalisation of this portion of the workplan and also the change of staff from Viet Nam left the project task difficult to complete as planned schedule. However, supporting staff in-country were largely able to fill in the capacity gap while the transition was taking place.

#### 9.2 Actions taken in response to annual report reviews

The feedback from annual reports was quite positive. It was said in in the review feedback that "the project appears extremely valuable and aligns with the IWT Challenge fund objectives".

During the implementation of the project in Y2, the project team had paid higher attention to the comments raised in the feedback and discussed with relevant partners to implement the project better. A brief response to specific feedback is listed as follows. The technical report itself explained the comments in more details.

**Comments1:** Whilst the progress reporting against activities is detailed and informative, it would useful to indicate if the ongoing activities are on track to be completed as expected in the proposal workplan.

**Response:** It was kept in mind during the project implementation. Change requests were submitted in advance for activities that could not happen as planned as well as the staff change.

**Comment 2:** Strong evidence has been provided for the development of the SOPs, training, workshops and analysis reports. It would be useful if further information is provided on the plans for the application of the SOPs (translation and disseminated) and case studies of the SOPs being adopted (Outcome 4).

**Response:** The SOPs had been translated into English as well as national languages in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania and shared to relevant companies and stakeholders. The SOPs were used during workshops and training events to internet and logistics companies. Some companies in China have applied the SOPs. For example, the content of SOP for logistic companies has been adopted in the training materials for front-line couriers in SF-Express; the Chinese companies in the Coalition all used the keywords provided in the SOP in checking for illegal wildlife products in their platforms. The application and adoption of the SOPs will be continued beyond the project duration.

**Comments 3:** As the project has just completed its first year, there has been limited progress reported for Output 2, "Improved law enforcement commitments and efforts to combat wildlife cybercrime in China, Vietnam, Cameroon and Tanzania". As the project progresses detailed reporting should be provided against the following key output indicators:

- 3.4 Five or more enforcement actions in China and at least one each in Vietnam, Cameroon and Tanzania triggered by reports from this project each year from 2017 until the end of the project.
- 4.4 Five or more enforcement actions triggered by reports from courier/logistics companies in China every year from 2017 until the end of the project.

**Responses:** There were four enforcement actions from China (two still under investigation) and one (under investigation) from Tanzania as described in Annex 2. There has not been law enforcement action as far as TRAFFIC knows triggered by reports from courier/logistics companies. Companies are reluctant to share such information. And also, it needs to be noted that the law enforcement actions always take time after receiving intelligence. More actions may happen, however, beyond the project period.

**Comment 4:** Due to the nature of the project, limited evidence has been submitted on the project's impact on the target species and poverty alleviation. The project should consider what further evidence could be provided to demonstrate the impact of the project and clarify the role of the project in establishing China's internet alliance to combat wildlife cybercrime.

**Response:** The project is working on the wildlife trade which might not have direct and immediate impact on the target species and poverty alleviation. The impact of this project is a decline in wildlife crime linked to the Internet as a result of collective and cooperative efforts by government agencies, internet and logistic companies and NGOs. The reduction of wildlife cybercrime will help to eliminate the factors that drive poaching to supply illegal wildlife markets and thereby reduce poaching levels overall. This will in turn support the stabilization, and then recovery, of the identified species populations, reducing a major threat to their native ecosystem. Hence it will support the restoration of the ecological balance of respective habitats.

#### 10. Other comments on achievements not covered elsewhere

We had planned to organize the international enforcement training event for customs officials in December 2018, and worked closely with the international cooperation division of Anti-smuggling Bureau of China Customs since July 2018. However, this activity was approved by the National Forestry & Grassland Administration (TRAFFIC/WWF's competent authority in China) very late although lots of efforts were made to push the government. So, a revised plan was discussed with Customs to adjust this activity within their 2019 annual plan; however Customs was only available in March 2019 which clashed with the Coalition event already scheduled. It was challenging to host two big international conferences in the same month. With great efforts from the team and support from the partners, both of these two events were successful and achieved significant impacts on combating wildlife cybercrime globally.

#### 11. Sustainability and legacy

The planned exit strategy is still valid. However, as wildlife crime linked to the internet needs increasing attention globally, the exit strategy from this phase of effort assumes also that only by continuing to focus on this multi-faceted issue, and securing the resources needed to do so, will ensure cumulative impact in the medium-to-long term. With this strategy in mind, TRAFFIC has applied to Defra IWT Challenge for a follow-up project to extend the work on wildlife cybercrime.

To ensure sustainable outcomes and impacts, the SOPs will be widely mobilised and adopted by e-commerce/logistics industry in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and possibly other countries. The project will aim to catalyse governments to allocate additional resources in combatting wildlife cybercrime, and work with businesses to provide long-term support to increase compliance. From TRAFFIC's work to date, it is clear that the government and related industries have a need and interest for these SOPs and have shown a strong interest in maintaining and updating them as necessary following the project's conclusion. Companies are becoming more active in taking actions and have initiated their own resources to combat wildlife cybercrime, as mentioned above giving the example from Tencent. China Express Association is working together with TRAFFIC proactively on trainings for couriers and its member companies. TRAFFIC provided the first-hand study results to the governments and engaged them in all relevant project activities, to advocate them to pay higher attention to combating wildlife cybercrime and improving better policy to regulate the boosting wildlife trade online.

The alliance of internet companies on combating wildlife cybercrime will be maintained and further developed after the project. It is expected that more companies will join the alliance and companies will take more initiatives to organize relevant activities to increase their capability on combating and preventing illegal wildlife trade online, and to attend global events to share experience and lessons with other countries.

TRAFFIC is acting as a pioneer and a facilitator to lobby and encourage industries to take part in fighting against illegal wildlife trade.

TRAFFIC continues to push government agencies to release relevant regulations on combating wildlife cybercrime and also facilitates companies to develop their own policies on combating wildlife cybercrime. It is expected and also planned that TRAFFIC will work more companies to adopt the SOPs in their policies with capacity to address the IWT issue, and help government equipped with sound laws and regulations. TRAFFIC will continue to provide science-based research information to government agencies and companies to help them better understand the issue. The SOPs developed in the project will act as a useful knowledge base and tool for companies in the long run. TRAFFIC will be periodically updating the content of SOPs.

The project will also be assisting governments in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania to carry out their commitments to the CITES Decisions 17.92-96 on 'Combating Wildlife Cybercrime', which were adopted during CITES CoP17.

#### 12. IWT Challenge Fund Identity

The UK aid logo with a sentence of "Funded by the UK Government through the Illegal Wildlife Trade Challenge Fund" was added in all relevant research reports for publication funded by this report, and also shown in the backdrop of the meetings/trainings. In TRAFFIC's press release of this project-funded events, donor was acknowledged, too.

When TRAFFIC organized big events, representatives from British Embassy in China were informed in advance and invited to deliver keynote speeches. British Embassy in China knew well on the progress of the project implementation, and corresponding achievements as well.

This project is a stand-out project, leading the work on combating wildlife cybercrime in the four target countries, including China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania. UK Government Fund was well publicised through the project activities.

## 13. OPTIONAL: Outstanding achievements of your project during the (300-400 words maximum). This section may be used for publicity purposes

I agree for the IWT Secretariat to publish the content of this section (please leave this line in to indicate your agreement to use any material you provide here)

The project has been completed beyond the designed outputs and made outstanding achievements. Two big achievements could be shared. More information can be provided upon request.

The engagement with internet companies in combating illegal wildlife trade online has been strengthened in China as well as other three countries during the implementation of the project. Supported by Chinese government authorities and TRAFFIC, internet companies based in China announced the formation of an alliance to combat wildlife cybercrime on 22 November 2017. The move was initiated by three Chinabased internet giants—Baidu, Alibaba and Tencent—and subsequently garnered further support from an additional eight Chinese internet companies. After this pioneering effort in China, TRAFFIC, WWF and IFAW facilitated further collaborative engagement on a global scale. On 7 March 2018, all the Chinese alliance members joined together with Google, Facebook and other international tech companies to form a unite Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online. The one-year anniversary event for the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online & Training workshop on Combating Wildlife Cybercrime was held on 6-7 March in Beijing, China. Eight new companies joined the Coalition including one from Viet Nam, one from Tanzania and six from China. The powerful stream of working on wildlife cybercrime and engaging with tech companies has encouraged other countries to follow the successful experience, such as in India, South Africa, EU etc.

Another big achievement was the engagement with couriers and logistic companies in refusing delivery of illegal wildlife and products. It became in a new milestone for influencing this industry in China. The Signing Ceremony of Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Thereof by Chinese Courier and Logistics Industry & International Forum was held in Beijing, China on 7-8 May 2019. 14 companies signed the Code and make commitments to curbing illegal trade in endangered species and protecting wildlife and biodiversity represented a milestone for years of effort. The Voluntary Code was announced by China Express Association (CEA) which has more than 200 members of logistic/courier companies and acts as a bridge and umbrella agent between industry and government. TRAFFIC's work with the logistic/courier companies has been acknowledged by the association and expected to have positive impacts at a government level in term of policy making and legislation development. The successful experience has been shared with other project countries. The active logistic/courier companies will be encouraged to join together with the network of transportation taskforce TRAFFIC is working for many years with the transportation industry in the future work.

#### 14. Finance and administration

#### 14.1 Project expenditure

Project spend (indicative) since las annual report	2018/19 and 2019/20 Grant (£)	2018/19 and 2019/20 Total actual IWT Costs (£)	Variance %	Comments (please explain significant variances)
Staff costs (see below)				
Consultancy costs				
Overhead Costs				
Travel and subsistence				
Operating Costs				
Capital items (see below)				
Others (see below)				
TOTAL				

Staff employed (Name and position)	Cost (£)
Xu Ling, Project Leader -China	
Chen Jing, Project Coordinator -China	
Zhou Fei, project supervision of activities -China	
Xiao Yu, project implementation -China	

TOTAL	
Graham Symons, project admin and finance support – Cambridge	
Salwa Elhalawani, project admin and finance support – Cambridge	
Shanny Pelle, Project Admin Officer – Tanzania	
William Crosmary, project implementation - Tanzania	
Sarah Ferguson, Office Director, implementation and supervision – Vietnam	
Nguyen Thuy Linh, Project Admin Officer – Vietnam	
Rosa Indenbaum, project implementation -Vietnam	
Elie Hakizumwami, Office Director, supervision- Cameroon	
Paulinus Ngeh, Office Director – Cameroon	
Amos Wainfen, Finance and Accounting Officer – Cameroon	
Donald Sunday Kigham, Project Admin Officer – Cameroon	
Luc Evouna Embola, Wildlife Trade Officer – Cameroon	
Denis Mahongol, project implementation – Cameroon	
Sean Lam, administrative and finance Support – Hong Kong	
Wilson Lau, M&E – Hong Kong	
Gua Lina, Finance Manager – China	
Xin Wenhua, implementation and communications in China	

Capital items – description	Capital items – cost (£)
Please detail what items were purchased with fund money, and where	
these will remain once the project finishes	
TOTAL	

Other items – description	Other items – cost (£)
Please provide a detailed breakdown for any single item over £1000	
Translation costs	
Bank and exchange fees	
Report Production	
Online training fees	
Hospitality	
Audit (DRAFT)	
TOTAL	

#### 14.2 Additional funds or in-kind contributions secured

Source of funding for project lifetime	Total (£)
TOTAL	

Source of funding for additional work after project lifetime	Total (£)
TOTAL	

#### 14.3 Value for Money

The implementation of the project strictly followed the rule of the donor and TRAFFIC. TRAFFIC has policies and systems in place to economize at all levels, whilst not impacting upon performance. Staff time, meeting, travel costs, and consultants are examples of key cost drivers that are specifically reviewed to assess where savings can be made.

Travel was planned well in advance where possible and staff were aware that any travel should be kept to a minimum. All project travel has used the lowest available economy class airfare on all trips according to TRAFFIC's rule.

TRAFFIC has been working with enforcement agencies and the private sector in combating wildlife crimes for many years and staff from the regional offices bring in experience and partnerships. TRAFFIC's strategically distribute its network of offices in key wildlife trading areas of the world which helps the wider distribution of the outcome of the project with less money.

Quotes were obtained to ensure that the project is using suppliers that present the best value at all times, whilst ensuring a fair approach to procurement. Private sector partners in China bore their own cost for travel and also provided meeting support, which very much reduced the cost for organising events. Government officials in China also bore their own cost in attending domestic trainings.

TRAFFIC reimburses reasonable actual expenses incurred when travelling and generally does not issue per diems apart from small daily allowances for incidentals in line with UK HMRC guidelines.

## Annex 1 Project's original (or most recently approved) logframe, including indicators, means of verification and assumptions.

Note: Insert your full logframe. If your logframe was changed since your application and was approved by a Change Request the newest approved version should be inserted here, otherwise insert application logframe.

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
Impact: Significant reduction in wildlife cybercrime in China, especially for species from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania, will lead to reduced poaching, as well as			
increases in security and wildlife-based livelihood opportunities for rural communities			
(Max 30 words)			

#### **Outcome:**

(Max 50 words)

By equipping social media/e-commerce/courier/logistics companies and law enforcement agencies with tools to break links between illegal wildlife buyers and sellers and increasing enforcement and industry capacity in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania, the project will increase detection and action against cybercrime, thereby reducing associated threats to people and wildlife.

- 0.1A decline of 30% or more from the baseline of combined online advertisements for products of identified species, including elephant, rhino, tiger, leopard, hawksbill, pangolin, saiga antelope and helmeted hornbill in 31 websites and one social media platform in China by 2019 (baseline to be determined by TRAFFIC and reported in TRAFFIC's online report to be published in March 2017 not be funded through DEFRA IWT)
- 0.2 A decline of 10% or more from the baseline of online advertisements for identified illegal wildlife species in each country of Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania (baseline to be determined by first online surveys in late 2017)
- 0.3 An increase of 30% or more from the baseline of seizures of wildlife offered for online sale in China, by 2019 (baseline to be determined by TRAFFIC, and reported in by TRAFFIC's Wildlife Enforcement Digest in January 2017)
- 0.4 Ten or more social media, e-commerce and courier/logistics companies in China, and five or more companies in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania will adopt the use of SOP manuals and protocols developed through this project by 2019

- 0.1 and 0.2 TRAFFIC's online monitoring results/reports, feedback from targeted social media and ecommerce companies
- 0.3 Seizure data provided to TRAFFIC by forest police, Customs, CITES and other government reports; media reports, inter-agency meeting minutes
- 0.4 Feedback from social media, ecommerce and courier/logistics companies

Chinese leadership has strong political will to realise China's development of an "Ecological Civilization", particularly Customs, forest police and other relevant government agencies who will continue to place a high priority on tackling wildlife crime, including cybercrimes.

E-commerce and social media remain willing to make good on their commitments to combat wildlife cybercrime and show a willingness to participate in trainings.

Law enforcement agencies are willing to respond to, and able to report back on results of investigations linked to intelligence packages provided by TRAFFIC and industry partners.

Courier/logistics companies remain willing to make good on their commitments to combat wildlife trafficking and show a willingness to participate in trainings, etc.

Outputs: 1. Understanding of, and commitments to cracking down on wildlife cybercrimes in, and linked to, markets in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania, including key locations and trade routes.	1.1 Improved capacity of TRAFFIC offices in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania in monitoring and detecting wildlife cybercrime after training by TRAFFIC China.  1.2 Five reports on illegal online wildlife trade released by TRAFFIC at project end (two annual reports in China, one online survey report each in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania)  1.3 One analysis report on the characteristics (including trade routes) and combating techniques of wildlife cybercrime linked to China markets by	1.1 TRAFFIC's online monitoring data and reports  1.2 Availability of analysis report and media reports  1.3 E-mail exchanges, call or meeting minutes	Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and other countries are interested and engaged in the project and in monitoring online wildlife trade.
	the end of 2017 (no comprehensive analysis exists)  1.4 Methodology developed to reduce cybercrime and transport of illegal wildlife products in China shared for pilot implementation with companies and government staff in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania by project end (no company and government staff is applying the methodology at present)		

2. Improved law enforcement
commitments and efforts to combat
wildlife cybercrime in China, Viet Nam,
Cameroon and Tanzania

- 2.1 Five or more law enforcement actions in China and at least one each in Vietnam, Cameroon and Tanzania triggered by reports generated through this project every year from 2017 until the end of project (baseline two seizures in China In 2016 based on TRAFFIC's intelligence)
- 2.2 Ten or more enforcement officials from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries visit China to participate in training with the goal of improving law enforcement and efforts to combat wildlife cybercrime
- 2.3 Chinese experience on combating wildlife cybercrime shared by law enforcement officials at a minimum of two global events to improve global cooperation by the end of the project

- 2.1 Government reports and interagency meeting minutes, and media reports
- 2.2 Media reports/exposures and meeting minutes
- 2.3 Media reports and feedback from China government

Law enforcement officials in China continue to prioritise actions to combat increasing global illegal wildlife trade online, and are willing to cooperate with TRAFFIC, social media companies and ecommerce companies to combat wildlife cybercrime

Law enforcement officials in Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries show interest and are willing to learn from China on combating wildlife cybercrime

3. Enhanced capacity to prevent and
detect illegal wildlife trade by
owners/operators of e-commerce and
social media platforms in China, Viet
Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania

- 3.1 The SOP manual on detecting and combating illegal online wildlife trade accepted1 by at least ten e-commerce and social platforms in China and 2 platforms each in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania by the end of the project (none of the e-commerce companies are currently using SOP manuals on preventing wildlife cybercrimes)
- 3.2 SOP Manual shared with at least 10 international partners or at two international conferences by the end of project (e.g. CITES, UNODC, WCO, INTERPOL) (No SOP manual on preventing illegal wildlife trade online is currently available in China)
- 3.3 A decline of 30% or more in online advertisements for products of identified species from the baseline in China by 2019 and a decline of 10% or more from baseline in Vietnam, Cameroon and Tanzania by 2019 (baselines to be determined by TRAFFIC China's online monitoring; report to be published in March 2017 and other countries' online survey report in late 2017)
- 3.4 Five or more enforcement actions in China and at least one each in Vietnam,

- 3.1 SOP manual for e-commerce and social media platforms
- 3.2 Meeting reports and media reports
- 3.3 TRAFFIC monitoring results
- 3.4 Government reports and feedback from enforcement agencies

BAT (Baidu, Alibaba and Tencent) continue to pay attention to increasing global illegal wildlife trade online, and are dedicated to cooperating with TRAFFIC and enforcement agencies to combat wildlife cybercrime.

Supported by other TRAFFIC offices, ecommerce companies and social media platforms in other priority countries also commit to combating wildlife cybercrime.

Law enforcement agencies are able to report back on results of investigations linked to intelligence packages provided by TRAFFIC and industry partners.

4. Enhanced capacity to deter wildlife
trafficking by courier/logistics
companies in China, Viet Nam,
Cameroon and Tanzania.

- 4.1 At least three key locations and three trade routes for wildlife trafficking along the supply chain of China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania are identified and shared with target companies by TRAFFIC's online wildlife trade analysis and ROUTES research results at the start of the project
- 4.2 The SOP manual on detecting and dealing with illegal wildlife products sold via online platforms accepted by at least 10 courier/logistics companies in China and 2 companies each in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania by project end
- 4.3 The SOP manual shared with at least 10 international partners/ or at two international conferences by end of project (e.g. CITES, UNODC, FIATA, IATA, WCO)
- 4.4 Five or more enforcement actions triggered by reports from courier/logistics companies in China every year from 2017 until the end of project (no seizure triggered by reports from these countries in China at present, based on information from China's National Forest Police Bureau)

- 4.1 TRAFFIC's online trade analysis data and report for trade involving China
- 4.2 SOP manual for courier/logistics companies
- 4.3 Meeting reports and media reports
- 4.4 Government reports and feedback from enforcement agencies

Courier/logistics companies, particularly the Top 10 who made a pledge to reject illegal wildlife trade (e.g. SF-Express) commits to combating illegal wildlife trafficking.

The SOP manual on detecting and combating illegal wildlife products during transportation will be accepted and implemented by courier/logistics companies in China and identified priorities countries.

Supported by other TRAFFIC offices, courier/logistic companies in other priority countries also commit to combating wildlife trafficking.

# Annex 2 Report of progress and achievements against final project logframe for the life of the project

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements
Impact Significant reduction in wildlife cybercrime Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania, will lead increases in security and wildlife-based liv communities	to reduced poaching, as well as	The four approaches designed in the project all contributed to the reduction in wildlife cybercrime in China.  Research in wildlife cybercrime and online surveys have provided better understanding in wildlife cybercrime for law enforcement agencies and other government agencies, private sectors, NGOs and public. Consistent monitoring of online markets has also provided an important source of intelligence to enforcement agencies and internet companies to take further investigative actions, including the taking down of illegal wildlife advertisements. Indeed, advertisements for illegal wildlife product online in China has significantly declined during the project period, according to TRAFFIC's online monitoring on target species for 31 websites and on China's most popular social media platform. The monitoring results show that, during the period of 2017-2018, the average number of new wildlife product advertisements every month on website platforms declined 73% compared to 2012-2016; compared with 2017, 2018's average number of daily advertisements on social media platforms declined by 25%, and daily active users declined by 22%. The reduction in wildlife product advertisements reflect the effort from website managers as well as effective enforcement actions.  Trainings and workshops accomplished within the project have increased law enforcement collaboration. Wildlife cybercrime is increasingly being recognized by law enforcement agencies in the project's four target countries, leading to enforcement actions linked to the internet being taken during the project period. For example, enforcement actions from China Customs have results in big seizures of elephant ivory and rhino horn, as well as the crackdown of two online platforms in April 2019 (http://english.customs.gov.cn/statics/1d8907c7-1cc9-480a-b55d-43182ebacf0a.html).  The project's engagement with e-commerce and social media companies have helped to create increased cooperation and synergy within the sector to tackle illegal wildlife trade online. In 201
		Tencent—with support from TRAFFIC, which subsequently garnered further interest and commitment from an additional eight Chinese internet companies.

collaborative engagement on a global scale. On 7 March 2018, all the Chinese alliance members joined together with Google, Facebook and other international tech companies to form a Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online. With the engagement of these internet companies and actions these companies take, the space for online advertisement for illegal wildlife products has significant declined according to the result of online monitoring.

Membership of the Coalition has since grown to 32 companies, with 8 new members joining during the Coalition's anniversary event in Beijing in March 2019. The companies within the Coalition have taken various initiatives in combating illegal wildlife trade. For instance, Tencent adheres to the concept of "Tech for Social Good", and has collaborated with TRAFFIC and other NGOs to develop an express channel-"Tencent for the Planet" for the public to report illegal trade information on wildlife and other commodities. NGOs and individual experts help to filter the submitted information, with suspicious activities further investigated by Tencent, and onwards to law enforcement agencies for action. The above steps take around 72 hours, and informers will receive the feedback from Tencent simultaneously. In order to promote such a system smoothly, on 19 December 2018, Tencent signed a strategic MoU with the National Forestry & Grassland Administration of China, which was witnessed by TRAFFIC and other six NGOs. Six NGO representatives have been nominated to form an advisory group for "Tencent for the Planet".

The experiences from China have been shared with Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania and other countries such as Japan. It is expected that the e-commerce and social media companies in these countries will also start to commit to combating illegal wildlife trade online. By catalyzing collaborations between these major internet companies in various countries and initiatives within their own platforms, significant flow-on effects would likely result in terms of raising the awareness of users about endangered wildlife and the risks in engaging with illegal wildlife trade online.

The project also achieved a big milestone during the project period in its engagement with courier/logistic companies. TRAFFIC was successful in establishing a partnership with the China Express Association, facilitating 14 leading courier and logistics companies in China to sign a Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Products Thereof. Through trainings and workshops, courier/logistic companies have been aware of the issue of IWT. The companies actively participated in these TRAFFIC-led activities while also initiating their own activities to address the issue. For example, SF Express has integrated the SOP produced through this project into its training application for staff. TRAFFIC was also invited to give lectures to the company's frontline deliverers.

As a major centre of demand for wildlife from Viet Nam, Tanzania and Cameroon, it is believed that the significant reduction of cybercrime in China will lead to the reduction of illegal poaching in other countries, while increasing the security and wildlife-based livelihood opportunities for rural communities.

Outcome: By equipping social media/e- commerce/courier/logistics companies and law enforcement agencies with tools to break links between illegal wildlife buyers and sellers and increasing enforcement and industry capacity in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania, the project will increase detection and action against cybercrime, thereby reducing associated threats to people and wildlife.

- 0.1 A decline of 30% or more from the baseline of combined online advertisements for products of identified species, including elephant, rhino, tiger, leopard, hawksbill, pangolin, saiga antelope and helmeted hornbill in 31 websites and one social media platform in China by 2019 (baseline to be determined by TRAFFIC and reported in TRAFFIC's online report to be published in March 2017 not be funded through DEFRA IWT)
- 0.2 A decline of 10% or more from the baseline of online advertisements for identified illegal wildlife species in each country of Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania (baseline to be determined by first online surveys in late 2017)
- 0.3 An increase of 30% or more from the baseline of seizures of wildlife offered for online sale in China, by 2019 (baseline to be determined by TRAFFIC, and reported in by TRAFFIC's Wildlife Enforcement Digest in January 2017)

- 0.1 According to online trade monitoring by TRAFFIC, the average number of new wildlife product advertisements each month during the period 2017-2018 on monitored website platforms declined by 73% compared to 2012-2016. On social media platforms, the average number of daily advertisements declined by 25% in 2018 compared to 2017 levels, with daily active users reducing by 22%.
- 0.2 Only a few advertisement posts were founded during online surveys conducted in Cameroon and Tanzania. There could be numerous inter-related reasons for this. First, online trade is not yet well developed or widely used in Tanzania and Cameroon, despite an internet penetration rate that has drastically increased over the past years. Second, the payment online and delivery services are not sufficiently developed or used; third, people are not yet familiar with shopping online; forth, people prefer to purchase illegal wildlife products in physical market or during arranged private meetings with sellers; and also, internet use is still a challenge in Cameroon based on regular network and electricity shortage. Mobile phones companies are the one developing now the 4G internet access for all, although costs remain high for normal citizen with modest financial means.
- 0.3 According the monthly seizure news digest produced by TRAFFIC, seizures of illegal wildlife products linked to the Internet have not changed drastically during the project period. It should be noted that news reports may not always include details of where illegal products were first found, unless they are cases of considerable volumes and where the online element of the trade played an important role in the case. Hence the number of reported seizures through online trade is likely to be an underestimate, especially given the results from TRAFFIC's market monitoring continue to indicate a shift in from physical markets to online platforms. However, there are great examples of intelligence generated through the project that has led to investigations and enforcement action. For example, information TRAFFIC provided about Grey parrots (Psittacus erithacus) for sale by one Facebook user in Tanzania was communicated to the National Multi-Agency Task Force for anti-poaching and anti-trafficking. Law-enforcement authorities in Tanzania were able to coordinate with their counterparts in Kenya, which led to an investigation that revealed significant quantities of live specimens illegally and regularly transported from

	0.4 Ten or more social media, e- commerce and courier/logistics companies in China, and five or more companies in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania will adopt the use of SOP manuals and protocols developed through this project by 2019.	Kenya to Tanzania. There are also four enforcement actions on wildlife crime linked to the internet in China due to intelligence reported by TRAFFIC.  0.4 The reach of the project in engaging with companies from in the internet and courier/logistics sectors were met beyond initial expectations of a minimum 15 companies. The main approach for encouraging the acceptance and use of the SOP manuals developed for the internet and logistics sectors is via a collaborative and voluntary approach for companies to join an industry alliance to tackle illegal wildlife trade online. 12 Internet companies in China first formed an alliance in November 2017 to work jointly to combat wildlife cybercrime. Each member company signs onto a charter committing to a zero-tolerance approach towards illegal wildlife trade, to detect and remove illegal wildlife trade advertisements on its platforms, to assist law enforcement in investigation and prosecution, amongst others. In meeting these commitments, internet companies make use of the SOP manual which provides guidance for preventing, detecting and dealing with information related to illegal wildlife identified.  Subsequent to the founding of the alliance of Chinese companies, a Coalition of internet companies in ending wildlife trafficking online was launched in March 2018, with a total of 32 member companies, including 19 Chinese companies, 1 company from Viet Nam and 1 from Tanzania (figure up to July 2019). More internet companies from the project's target countries and other countries are expected to join the Coalition in future.  Similarly, the recent signing of the Voluntary Code of Practice to refuse delivery of illegal wildlife and products thereof, by 14 leading courier and logistics companies (from China and global) in May 2019, translates to similar commitments. The SOP manual for the courier and logistics companies provides a set of guidance for companies to implement and meet the commitments under the Code of Practice. While TRAFFIC has been collaborating with companies
Output 1. Insert agreed Outputs with Activities relevant to that output in lines below  Understanding of, and commitments to cracking down on wildlife cyber- crimes in, and linked to, markets in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania, including key locations and trade routes.	Insert <b>agreed</b> output level indicators)  1.1Improved capacity of TRAFFIC offices in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania in monitoring and detecting wildlife cybercrime after training by TRAFFIC China.	<ul> <li>1.1 Training was conducted, and survey methods agreed and harmonised, during the project kick off meeting in September 2017 (supporting material No.1&amp;2). TRAFFIC offices in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania have subsequently conducted annual online market surveys and have prepared report briefs of the survey findings (see 1.2).</li> <li>1.2 Seven reports have been produced detailing the state of illegal wildlife trade online in the 4 target countries in the project: China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania. A report briefing was produced detailing the findings of online trade monitoring in 2017 in China (supporting material No.3-1). Another report</li> </ul>

- 1.2 Five reports on illegal online wildlife trade released by TRAFFIC at project end (two annual reports in China, one online survey report each in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania)
- 1.3 One analysis report on the characteristics (including trade routes) and combating techniques of wildlife cybercrime linked to China markets by the end of 2017 (no comprehensive analysis exists)
- 1.4 Methodology developed to reduce cybercrime and transport of illegal wildlife products in China shared for pilot implementation with companies and government staff in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania by project end (no company and government staff is applying the methodology at present)

- briefing was released based on the monitoring results in China, examining trends in online trade between 2017 and 2018 (supporting material No.3-2). A report was produced in Viet Nam (supporting material No.4), while two reports were produced in each country for Tanzania (supporting material No.5) and Cameroon (supporting material No.6). Given sizeable online markets for wildlife products in the two African countries were not sizeable, the reports were not released. However, the survey results are still important baseline information.
- 1.3 An analysis report titled "Combating Wildlife Crime Linked to the Internet: Global Trend and China's Experiences" has been completed and published on the TRAFFIC website. The report reviews the policies and actions from International organizations, other countries and shared the characteristics of wildlife cybercrime in China and experiences from China in combating wildlife cybercrime. Suggestions are also given in the end of the report. (supporting material No.7).
- 1.4 A collaborative and industry-led approach was adopted as an effective method of motivating actions towards combating cybercrime and the transport of illegal wildlife products. TRAFFIC helped pioneer the development of an alliance of internet companies, led by three Chinese internet giants - Baidu, Alibaba and Tencent – to combat wildlife cybercrime in November 2017. The alliance member committed to adhereing to an agreed Charter, which includes taking a zero-tolerance approach towards illegal wildlife trade, detecting and removing illegal wildlife advertisements on their platforms, and assisting law enforcement in investigations, amongst other obligations. This collaborative approach has been successful in not only encouraging internet companies to take concerted action and share best practices, but have also encouraged other key players in the industry to join the alliance and adopt similar commitments. This approach in garnering industry action was expanded in March 2018 with the formation of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online, which includes leading tech companies such as Google, eBay and Facebook pledging to work together to reduce wildlife trafficking across platforms. As of July 2019, the Coalition has 32 participating companies, and includes companies from project-relevant countries, i.e. Kupatana from Tanzania and Sapo from Viet Nam. TRAFFIC has modelled this industry collaboration approach with the courier and logistics sector in China. In May 2019, TRAFFIC/WWF coordinated the signing of a Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Products Thereof by 14 leading courier and logistics companies in China, jointly committing to curbing illegal wildlife trade in their operations (see Outcome 4). Representatives from Viet Nam attended the event and spoke highly for the actions taken by Chinese courier and logistic companies and expressed that they would take the experiences back to Viet Nam and apply into practice.

Activity 1.1

The desktop research to identify key locations and trade routes for wildlife trafficking relating to China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania was carried out.

Undertaking desktop research to identify key industry stakeholders with links to China in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania	The key findings were presented and discussed at the kick-off meeting on 19-22 September 2017. The key industry stakeholder mapping in each of the target countries were also conducted. (supporting material No.8)
Activity 1.2 Conducting a comprehensive training for TRAFFIC staff from Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania to standardize monitoring methodologies for online wildlife trade	The kick-off meeting and an online monitoring training workshop were organized in Beijing on 19-22 September 2017. A total of 16 TRAFFIC staff from mainland China, Hongkong SAR, Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania, the US, Belgium, Japan and South Africa attended the meeting/workshop. TRAFFIC China introduced the existing monitoring methodologies used for online wildlife trade, and then discussed with the colleagues from other offices to optimize and standardize the methodologies for this project.
	A meeting with Tencent took place on 19 <sup>th</sup> September to discuss the collaboration on establishing an internet company alliance against illegal wildlife trade.
	A half-day visit to Baidu was also organized during the workshop. Baidu introduced their work on combating wildlife cybercrime and showed their interest in using Baidu Index to predict the trend of illegal wildlife trade. Training materials and participant registration form are attached as supporting material No.2.
Activity 1.3 Conducting monthly online monitoring of availability of illegal wildlife products in China	Online monitoring surveys on the availability of illegal wildlife products on e- commerce and social media platforms in China have been conducted every month during the project period, and the respective results are recorded for
Activity 1.4 Completing and releasing two reports on China's annual online monitoring	further analysis to produce an annual report.
	The report of "Wildlife Cybercrime Trends in China-Online Monitoring Results 2017-2018" was released online. (supporting material No.3-2)
<b>Activity 1.5</b> Conducting two rounds of one-off online monitoring on the availability of illegal wildlife products in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania	TRAFFIC offices in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania conducted one-off surveys in 2017 and 2018 to assess the availability of illegal wildlife products on websites and social media platforms.
Activity 1.6 Completing and releasing the one-off online monitoring briefings for Viet Nam, Tanzania and Cameroon	The briefing papers based on the one-off online surveys in 2018 in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania were completed and translated into Vietnamese, French and Kiswahili.
	The English version of the briefings were released on the TRAFFIC websites. (supporting material No.4, No.5, No.6)
Activity 1.7 Cooperating with Nanjing Forest Police College to carry out an analysis on the characteristics and combating techniques of wildlife cybercrime in China and globally	The analysis on the characteristics of wildlife cybercrime in China and globally, and techniques for combatting this, was carried out by two consultants. The Chinese draft was reviewed by the Nanjing Forest Police Bureau. The translated English version were subsequently reviewed by TRAFFIC International and external experts.

Activity 1.8. Releasing and widely sharing cybercrime	ng analysis report on the global wildlife	A report analysing global wildlife cybercrime has been released on TRAFFIC website, providing access to a wider range of audiences and organizations interested in illegal wildlife trade online. It has specifically been reviewed and shared with TRAFFIC partners and networks around the world. It will be further disseminated during the CITES COP18 in Geneva in August 2019. (supporting material No.7)
Output 2. Improved law enforcement commitments and efforts to combat wildlife cybercrime in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania	2.1 Five or more law enforcement actions in China and at least one each in Vietnam, Cameroon and Tanzania triggered by reports generated through this project every year from 2017 until the end of project (baseline two seizures in China In 2016 based on TRAFFIC's intelligence)  2.2Ten or more enforcement officials from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries visit China to participate in training with the goal of improving law enforcement and efforts to combat wildlife cybercrime  2.3 Chinese experience on combating wildlife cybercrime shared by law enforcement officials at a minimum of two global events to improve global cooperation by the end of the project	2.1 According to the informal communications with law enforcement agencies in China, there are a total of four law enforcement actions arising from the efforts of this project. Two of these investigations have been completed with more than 20kg ivory seized and two are still under investigation. There was one case on Grey Parrots from Tanzania as mentioned in 0.3.  It should be noted that intelligence information given to law enforcement agencies have a lengthy lag time between the initial sharing of information to prosecution action, of 1-2 years or more. Hence much of the data and information shared through this project could yield enforcement and prosecutorial results beyond the project period.  2.2 A customs training event, co-organised by TRAFFIC and China Customs, was conducted in Suzhou, China, in March 2019. There were 10 international delegates from law enforcement agencies in Viet Nam (4), Cameroon (3) and Tanzania (3) in attendance, as well as 50 customs officials from 8 other countries, including China. An action plan was provisionally developed by the training participants to provide a practical approach to sharing information efficiently, and to establish standardised procedures for collecting and processing, as well as mutually recognising, information as evidence. (supporting material No.9)  2.3 The project supported Ms. SHEN Xinlu from China Customs to attend the 28th Meeting of the INTERPOL Wildlife Crime Working Group in Singapore on 9-13 October 2017. Ms. Shen gave a presentation on how China Customs combats wildlife crime, in particular discussed its collaborative approach with NGOs such as TRAFFIC, as well as with private sector companies in the internet and logistics sector, in tackling illegal wildlife trade. (supporting material No.10)  One representative from China Customs attended the launch event for the formation of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in San Francisco on 7 March 2018. The representative also had a separate meeting with officials from USFWS and USDOS to
<b>Activity 2.1</b> Timely sharing of online magencies and website manager for their to		The online monitoring results in the four target countries had been shared in a timely manner with managers of websites and social media platforms, as well as enforcement agencies for their follow-up. Illegal advertisements had been removed by the websites, and social media accounts with illegal wildlife

	advertisements had been shut down based on TRAFFIC's intelligence.
	Further investigations are being undertaken by enforcement agencies.
Activity 2.2 Cooperating with the National Forest Police Bureau to facilitate two domestic training events for law enforcement agencies to improve their capacity on combating wild- life cybercrime	On 28-30 November 2017, a national training workshop on combatting wildlife crime through internet and courier channels for enforcement officials was held in Nanjing Forest Police College. More than 60 participants from Forest Police, Custom, Administration of Industry & Commerce, Procuratorate and Postal Bureau, internet and logistic companies attended the training. More information is found in the press release (http://www.traffic.org/home/2017/12/1/traffic-helpstrain-china-enforcement-agencies-to-combat-wil.html). (Agenda and participant registration list are attached as supporting material No.12)
	On 4-8 June 2018, China's Ministerial Level Coordination Mechanism for Combating Illegal Wildlife Trade was enhanced through a training workshop jointly organised by the Department of Wildlife Conservation and Nature Reserve Management, National Forestry and Grassland Administration (NFGA), TRAFFIC and China Wildlife Conservation Association (CWCA) in Haikou, China, which is supported by the project. The intention of the workshop was to facilitate the communications and coordination between government and the private sector in law enforcement efforts against wildlife crime. More than 70 government representatives including leading agencies and experts joined the first meeting to take place since the ministerial level inter-governmental coordination mechanism to combat illegal wildlife trade was formed in 2016. Several enforcement agencies, including Forest Police, Customs, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs, the Administration for Industry and Commerce, and the Ministry of Public Security, joined the workshop. <a href="https://www.traffic.org/news/workshop-held-to-consolidate-interagency-law-enforcement-mechanism-in-china/">https://www.traffic.org/news/workshop-held-to-consolidate-interagency-law-enforcement-mechanism-in-china/</a> (supporting material in No.13)
	On 26-27 June 2018, TRAFFIC Supported Nanjing Forest Police College to hold a law enforcement training with over 80 front-line forest police officials from 21 provinces. The aim of the training was to improve the abilities of law enforcement officers to combat illegal wildlife trade through internet and logistics channels. TRAFFIC also invited internet companies such as Baidu, Alibaba and Kuaishou to introduce their operational procedures in detecting illegal wildlife traders on their platforms with enforcement departments. TRAFFIC China introduced the current status of illegal wildlife trade in China and the trends of illegal wildlife trade through internet and logistics channels in wildlife crimes. TRAFFIC also gave an overview of two Standard Operational Procedures (SOPs) for internet and logistics industries, providing insights into the detection and deterrence of illegal wildlife trade and suggested forest police to use SOPs to train companies and initiate enforcement cooperation in future (supporting material No.14).
	On 26 February 2019, TRAFFIC worked with Shanghai Branch of China CITES MA to organize a training workshop in Shanghai, targeting businesses that may

	be engaged in wildlife trade in Shanghai, Jiangsu and Zhejiang. More than 100 participants from government agencies, logistic/courier companies, auction companies, internet companies, import and export companies, animal artificial breeding companies and NGOs participated in the workshop. The meeting summed up the results of the Panyang No. 3 Action (a law enforcement action against IWT initiated by Shanghai, Jiangsu, Zhejiang), and awarded well performed organizations and individuals, interpreted the relevant laws and regulations, and exchanged the results of illegal trade monitoring. The workshop also discussed the adoption of a pledge against IWT. (supporting material No.15)
Activity 2.3 Cooperating with the China CITES MA to facilitate an international training event with study tours for law enforcement agencies from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries to improve their capacity on combating wildlife cybercrime	During 25th-30th March 2019, more than 60 Customs officials from 12 countries including Cambodia, Cameroon, China, Laos, Malaysia, Mongolia, Myanmar, Namibia, Nigeria, Tanzania, Thailand, and Viet Nam participated in the Combating Smuggling of Endangered Species" Asia-Africa Customs Workshop seeking for improved collaboration against wildlife trafficking among countries. The event was jointly facilitated by TRAFFIC China and the Department of International Cooperation, General Administration of Customs, People's Republic of China (GACC). The workshop focused on sharing the successes and lessons from China's experience in combating smuggling of endangered species, as well as exchanges of best practices among different countries toward the enhancement of international cooperation in law enforcement action along the entire trafficking chain, from source to end-use market. Mr Wang He, Deputy Director General of the Anti-Smuggling Bureau, General Administration of China Customs (GACC) shared the experience of China Customs in cracking down on wildlife smuggling. He emphasized the necessity of close cooperation between countries in joint law enforcement efforts in the increasingly complex dynamics of international trade.  Customs representatives shared their best practices, including challenges of international law enforcement collaboration and discussed action plans to address wildlife cybercrime and other crimes. Guest speakers from UNODC, the CITES Management Authority of China, TRAFFIC, and China Customs gave insights on approaches and investigations of wildlife and forest crimes, CITES implementation and enforcement, and case studies on international wildlife smuggling and wildlife cybercrime. (supporting material No.9)  The activity was also shared in the IWT Challenge Newsletter. (supporting material No.9-5)
Activity 2.4 Supporting China's law enforcement officials to participate in global cybercrime events and sharing of experiences	One representative from China Customs to attend the 28th Meeting of the INTERPOL Wildlife Crime Working Group on 9-13 October 2017 in Singapore with support from the project. A trip summary from the representative (in Chinese) is attached as supporting material No.10.

One representative from China Customs attended the launch event for the formation of Global Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in San Francisco, USA on 7 March 2018. The representative also had a separate meeting with US government officials from USDOS and USFWS to discuss the status and challenges on combating wildlife cybercrime in China and the US. Group photos of this exchange are attached as supporting material No.11. There were other opportunities where TRAFFIC shared its experiences of combating cybercrime in China to global law enforcement agencies. One staff from TRAFFIC attended the 30th Administrative Meeting for National Contact Points of Regional Intelligence Liaison Office for Asia and the Pacific (RILO AP) WCO in Solo, Indonesia in September 2018 and gave a presentation on Combating Wildlife Cybercrime in China in the session of Environment Programme. TRAFFIC is the only NGO invited to the meeting. TRAFFIC also presented at the Regional Workshop on Combating Environmental Crime on 22-23 November 2018 in Shanghai, China co-hosted by China Customs and the World Customs Organisation and gave a presentation on Combating wildlife cybercrime in China. A representative from Alibaba also shared how the company was combating illegal wildlife trade on its platforms. (supporting material No.16) 3.1 The SOP manual on detecting Output 3. Enhanced capacity to 3.1 The SOP manual on detecting and combatting illegal wildlife trade online prevent and detect illegal wildlife trade and combating illegal online had been shared widely with Chinese internet companies, with training events by owners/operators of e-commerce wildlife trade accepted by at least provided to seven internet companies in March 2018, which brought together and social media platforms in China. ten e-commerce over 30 internet security staff, as well as various one-on-one training provided Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania and social platforms in China and 2 to individual internet companies such as Tencent, Baidu and Alibaba at their requests. During the one-year anniversary event for the Coalition to End platforms each in Viet Nam, Wildlife Trafficking Online, the participating internet companies within the Cameroon and Tanzania by the end Coalition, in addition to other non-member companies, were also introduced to of the project (none of the ethe SOP manual. Representatives from two tech companies from Viet Nam commerce companies are currently and one from Tanzania attended the event. The translated versions of the SOP using SOP manuals on preventing were also shared to the companies. wildlife cybercrimes) 3.2 Since the completion of the SOP in Chinese and translation in English, copies of the manual had been shared widely through two international events 3.2 SOP Manual shared with at including the training event at the Baidu headquarters in Beijing in March 2018, least 10 international partners or at and the one-year anniversary event of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking two international conferences by the Online on 6-7<sup>th</sup> March 2019 in Beijing. Both events included the participation of end of project (e.g. CITES, UNODC, international partners such as the CITES Secretariat, as well as international WCO, INTERPOL) (No SOP NGO partners including IFAW, WildAid, WCS and NRDC. The SOP was also shared with various national government agencies at the Coalition event in manual on preventing illegal wildlife March 2019, including China's National Forestry and Grassland Administration trade online is currently available in (NFGA), Anti-smuggling Bureau of the General Administration of China China) Customs (GACC), National Forest Police Bureau, Office of the Central

Cyberspace Affairs Commission, Market Supervision Bureau, and the Fisheries

online adver of identified shaseline in Codecline of 10 baseline in Volume Tanzania by determined to online monitor published in countries' on 2017)  3.4 Five or main China and a Vietnam, Cantriggered by revery year from project (basel reported in Teleported in Telepo	e of 30% or more in tisements for products species from the China by 2019 and a 10% or more from Vietnam, Cameroon and 2019 (baselines to be by TRAFFIC China's oring; report to be March 2017 and other aline survey report in late ore enforcement actions at least one each in heroon and Tanzania eports from this project of 2017 until end of ine to be determined and RAFFIC's Wildlife Digest in January 2017)	Bureau. Overseas government representatives from the European Union, and embassies of UK and USA, GIZ–the German development agency, were also informed of the SOP Manual.  3.3 refer to 0.1 & 0.2.  3.4 refer to 2.1
Activity 3.1 Engaging China's leading online companies (e.g. Tencent, Alibaba and Baidu), VECOM in Viet Nam and other partners to develop a SOP manual on preventing and detecting wildlife cybercrime		The Chinese version of the SOP Manual for e-commerce companies to deter and prevent illegal wildlife trade was prepared with contributions from experts, internet companies such as Tencent, Alibaba, Baidu and government officials. The finalized version in Chinese can be found in supporting material No.17.
Activity 3.2 Organising a review workshop to finalise the wildlife cybercrime manual		The draft SOP had undergone several rounds of reviews by external experts and internet companies during the project period. The SOP was introduced and discussed on 22 November 2017, when the alliance of China-based internet companies to combat illegal wildlife trade online was formed. It was also reviewed during the training workshops for enforcement officers in Nanjing on 28-30 November 2017, and specifically with Baidu on 21 March 2018.
Activity 3.3Translating the Chinese language wildlife cybercrime SOP manual into English, Vietnamese, Kiswahili and French for distribution in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and other countries, as well as with international partners, e.g. UNODC, WCO, INTERPOL, CITES Secretariat and through private sector networks		The SOP had been translated into English, Vietnamese, Kiswahili and French for wider distribution in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and other countries, as well as with international partners including CITES Secretariat, WCO, international NGO partners including IFAW, WildAid, WCS and NRDC. The SOP had been shared with Kupatana in Tanzania, Sapo in Vietnam, Jumia in Cameroon (supporting material No.18)

Activity 3.4Facilitating a training event for China's online companies on how to use the wildlife cybercrime SOP manual in their daily operations, and thus minimise risk to their business posed by trading illegal wildlife products	Hosted by Baidu, China's leading internet search engine, a training workshop was organized in Beijing in March 2018 on how the SOP could be adopted into practice by internet companies. The workshop brought together more than 30 internet security staff from Baidu, Tencent, 58, Baixing Wang, Wen Wan Tian Xia, Zhuan Zhuan, and Kuaishou. (supporting material No.19)	
	During the one-year anniversary event for the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in Beijing on 6-7 <sup>th</sup> March 2019, the SOP was presented by TRAFFIC to companies, which was followed by a Q&A on the document's contents. (supporting material No.20)	
<b>Activity 3.5</b> Working with Tencent or other leading online Chinese companies to facilitate a training event for social media and e-commerce companies from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries to improve their capacity on preventing and detecting wildlife cybercrime;	On 6-7 March 2019, the one-year anniversary of the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online was celebrated in Beijing during an event themed under "Protecting Wildlife with Technology". More than 100 participants attended the event including internet companies from China (such as Tencent) and other	
Activity 3.6 Conduct a study tour for private sector representatives from Tanzania, Cameroon and Viet Nam under Activity 3.5 to learn and apply the wildlife cybercrime SOP, and exchange with enforcement officials and social media/e-commerce champions from China;	countries alongside representatives from Chinese and other national government agencies, the CITES Secretariat, academia and NGOs. Importantly, three companies from Viet Nam and Tanzania also joined the event, two of whom became new members of the Coalition (as mentioned in Outputs 1.4 and Activity 3.1). The event provided an opportunity to assess the performance and impacts achieved by the Coalition thus far. Participants also discussed how global ecommerce, technology, and social media companies effectively prevent and combat illegal wildlife trade on their channels.	
	During the event, TRAFFIC organized a training workshop, including a field trip to Baidu. Experts from the CITES Secretariat, CITES Scientific Authority, Helsinki University and WCO RILO were invited to give presentations. In Baidu, TRAFFIC presented the SOP for internet companies and Baidu shared their experience on combating wildlife cybercrime. (supporting material No.20)	
Activity 3.7 Supporting China's e-commerce and social media companies to participate in global cybercrime events and share experiences	TRAFFIC China brought its corporate partners, Baidu and SF-Express to attend the first IWT symposium in Oxford on 25-27 September 2017. The Business partners showcased their partnerships with TRAFFIC in combating wildlife crime in the internet and logistics/transportation industries. Baidu introduced their keywords screening on its search engine, Bulletin Board System and other information sharing platforms. SF-express introduced their risk control strategy regarding wildlife products delivery and how it was applied in the field. About 800 representatives participated in the symposium and 50 audience participated the side events.	
	Representatives from China-based internet companies, including Baidu, Tencent, Alibaba and Kuaishou, attended the launch event for the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online in San Francisco on 7 March 2018. They shared their experiences in combating wildlife cybercrime. (supporting material No.21)	

Output 4. Enhanced capacity to deter
wildlife trafficking by courier/logistics
companies in China, Viet Nam,
Cameroon and Tanzania.

- 4.1 At least three key locations and three trade routes for wildlife trafficking along the supply chain of China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania are identified and shared with target companies by TRAFFIC's online wildlife trade analysis and ROUTES research results at the start of the project
- 4.2 The SOP manual on detecting and dealing with illegal wildlife products sold via online platforms accepted by at least 10 courier/logistics companies in China and 2 companies each in Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania by project end
- 4.3 The SOP manual shared with at least 10 international partners/ or at two international conferences by end of project (e.g. CITES, UNODC, FIATA, IATA, WCO)
- 4.4 Five or more enforcement actions triggered by reports from courier/logistics companies in China every year from 2017 until the end of project (no seizure triggered by reports from these countries in China at present, based on information from China's National Forest Police Bureau)

Activities 3.5-3.6 also provided an opportunity for China's e-commerce and social media companies to share experience to global companies and international partners, as mentioned in output progress 3.2.

- 4.1 The key locations and trade routes for wildlife trafficking involving the project's target countries China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania were initially identified during the project inception meeting in September 2017. These include the following trade routes:
  - Cameroon-Hongkong SAR-mainland China
  - Cameroon-mainland China
  - Central African countries-Cameroon-Hongkong SAR-mainland China
  - Tanzania- Hongkong SAR/Southeast Asia (Myanmar, Viet Nam, Philippines)-mainland China
  - Cameroon, Tanzania -Nigeria- Myanmar, Viet Nam, Hongkong SAR, Philippines—mainland China

Subsequent events also presented and discussed key transportation routes for wildlife trafficking, detailing key locations and trade routes for specific taxa and products in the illicit trade. First, the WCO's 30<sup>th</sup> Administrative Meeting for National Contact Points of Regional Intelligence Liaison Office for Asia and the Pacific (RILO AP), held in Solo, Indonesia on 4-6 September 2018, provided important insights on wildlife trafficking routes and transportation methods from the network of national Customs agencies in the Asia-Pacific region. Second, the International Forum on Cracking Down Wildlife Trafficking through Transportation and Logistics Services in Beijing, China on 7-8<sup>th</sup> May 2019 also included presentations from WCO on the major conveyances of illegal wildlife trade, identification methods for suspicious species and products by the Nanjing Forest Police College, as well as the methods and means of smuggling and concealing wildlife products by TRAFFIC.

4.2 Training presentations on the SOP Manual were given to participants from the courier and logistics sector during the International Forum in Beijing on May 2019 (see 4.1). Commitments to taking a zero-tolerance approach to illegal wildlife trade were made through the signing of a voluntary Code of Conduct at the International Forum by 12 China-based courier and logistics companies, and two international companies. Participants from two Vietnamese companies were also present at the International Forum, while three delegates from Tanzania's courier industry could not gain entry into China at the last minute due to visa issues. As part of the sustainability of this project, the SOP Manual will continue to be advocated by TRAFFIC for use by the companies signing on to the Code of Conduct, as a way to meet the commitments therein.

During the International Forum, the China Express Association, a Chinese courier company and the Vice Chairman of the Vietnam Automobile

		Transportation Association (representing the country's courier and logistics sector) spoke about the initiatives they had put in place to combat illegal wildlife trade at the company and industry levels, aspects of which were drawn from the SOP Manual developed through this project.
		4.3 The International Forum in Beijing on 7-8 <sup>th</sup> May 2019 was also attended by various international partners including FIATA, WCO, CITES Secretariat, the Royal Foundation (presented by the British Embassy in Beijing), German Embassy, as well as international NGOs IFAW and WildAid. Present to share insights about China's progress and challenges included representatives from the National Forest and Grassland Administration, State Post Bureau, China's CITES MA, Guangzhou Airport Customs and Nanjing Forest Police College.
		4.4. refer to 2.1
Activity 4.1 Conducting desktop review to id for wildlife trafficking relating to China, Viet N		The key locations and trade routes for wildlife trafficking involving the project's target countries – China, Viet Nam, Cameroon and Tanzania – were initially identified during the project inception meeting in September 2017.
Activity 4.2 Working with partners (e.g. DHL, SF-Express and VATA in Viet Nam) to develop a SOP manual on detecting and dealing with illegal wildlife products for the logistics/courier sector		The first draft of the Chinese version of the SOP Manual for logistic/courier companies was developed with contribution from experts and logistic companies include SF, DHL, VATA. The SOP was designed as a live document and can be updated and adapted with new information. TRAFFIC is committed to continuously improving the document in future to take account of emerging changes and insights in the industry. (supporting material No.22)
Activity 4.3 Organising a review workshop to finalise the logistics/courier sector manual		The draft SOP had been reviewed for several times by experts and logistic/courier companies through meetings and calls during the project period. The SOP was introduced and discussed in a training workshop in Nanjing on 28-30 November 2017. Feedback from the workshop was addressed in latter versions of the document.
Activity 4.4 Translating the Chinese language logistics/courier sector SOP manual into English, Viet Namese, Kiswahili and French for distribution in China, Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and other countries, as well as with international partners, e.g. CITES, UNODC, WCO, FIATA, IATA and through private sector networks		The SOP had been translated into English, Vietnamese, Kiswahili and French (supporting material No.23) for wider distribution in Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and other countries, as well as being shared with international partners, as mentioned in Output 4.3. TRAFFIC's Tanzania office shared the SOPs with three transportation/logistic companies, and the Chief Executive Officer of the Transporters Association of Tanzania (TAT) as well. The SOP was also introduced to VATA and Thanh Hoa Transportation LLC company from Viet Nam. TRAFFIC is planning to share the SOP with companies in Cameroon as a useful guideline.
Activity 4.5 Facilitating a training event for C companies on how to use the logistics/courie		On 8 March 2018, the draft SOP was introduced in a training workshop organized by Express Mail Service (EMS) company for more than 170 EMS staff. The attendees learned how to detect and deal with illegal wildlife products during

operations, and thus minimise risk to their business posed by transporting illegal wildlife products;

transportation, following the instructions of the SOP, and thereby reduce the risk for the company and of individual couriers. (supporting material No.24)

On 17 July 2018, TRAFFIC supported China Railway in holding a training workshop for its staff from their Parcel and Luggage Transportation Department (PLTD), which included 131 managers from PLTE in all main railway stations of China. These managers were responsible to supervise the receiving and delivering of parcels and luggage's transported by China Railway. Experts from National Forest Police Bureau and Nanjing Forest Police College introduced CITES and national regulations, typical criminal cases of transporting illegal wildlife products and species identification knowledge. TRAFFIC introduced the SOP for the logistics industry, summarized the training contents and encouraged trainees to report intelligence of illegal wildlife transportation to police department. China Railway spoke highly of this training and asked all trainees to actively share the knowledge learnt with their colleagues to mainstream the techniques for intercepting illegal wildlife products during transportation. (supporting material No.25)

On 15 June 2019, TRAFFIC and China Express Association jointly hosted a 'refusing illegal wildlife transport' training workshop for Yunnan Province-based courier companies. Around 100 managers and staff from Chinese courier companies, including Best Express, EMS, Deppon, JD, Shentong (STO), Shunfeng (SF-Express), Suning, Yuantong (YTO), Yunda, Zhaijisong (ZJS) and Zhongtong (ZTO), participated the workshop. Experts were invited by TRAFFIC to give presentations to trainees, with topics ranging from CITES and related regulation and laws, postal regulations on prevention of illegal delivery of goods, specific cases on combating wildlife crimes in transportation channels, the detection and identification of common illegal wildlife products in delivery channels. (supporting document in No.26)

**Activity 4.6** Working with DHL, SF-Express and other partners to facilitate a training event for courier/logistics companies from Viet Nam, Cameroon, Tanzania and/or other countries to improve their capacity on detecting and dealing with illegal wildlife products

**Activity 4.7** Conduct a study for private sector representatives from Tanzania, Cameroon and Viet Nam under Activity 4.6 to learn about how the SOP can be applied, and ex- change with enforcement officials and courier/logistics champions from China;

On 8 May 2019, 14 leading courier and logistics companies in China signed a Voluntary Code of Practice to Refuse Delivery of Illegal Wildlife and Products Thereof to underline their commitment to curbing illegal trade in wild animals and plants and protect endangered wildlife species and biodiversity (see Output 4.2).

Following the ceremony, a 1.5-day training workshop was held to build capacity within the industry on species identification skills, share success and lessons learned, while the Customs and Forest Police shared details of a number of seizures involving the courier and logistics industries. Participants also included representatives of companies operating in Viet Nam who spoke about how they would apply the advanced measures currently practiced by Chinese companies.

	Field study to Asia No.1 Smart Logistics Center of JD-Logistics was organized on the afternoon of 8 May, showcasing an example of how technology is helping to increase efficiency and traceability, and thereby minimising risk of delivering sanctioned products, in the courier and logistic industry. (supporting material No.27)
Activity 4.8 Supporting courier/logistics companies with branches in China to participate in global events and share experiences	TRAFFIC China brought its corporate partners, Baidu and SF-Express, to attend the first IWT symposium in Oxford on 25-27 September 2017. The Business partners showcased partnership with TRAFFIC in combating wildlife crime in the internet and logistics/courier industries. Baidu introduced their keywords screening of its search engine, BBS and other information sharing platforms. SF-express introduced their risk control strategy regarding wildlife products delivery and its application in practice. About 800 representatives participated in the symposium and 50 people participated the side event.

### **Annex 3 IWT Contacts**

Ref No	IWT042	
Project Title	Combatting global wildlife cybercrime: building on the success in China	
Project Leader Details		
Name	XU Ling (Ms)	
Role within IWT Project	Overall supervision the project	
Address		
Phone		
Fax/Skype		
Email		
Partner 1		
Name	Zhang Yue	
Organisation	China CITES MA	
Role within IWT Project	Support the implementation of activities related to Chinese government	
Address		
Fax/Skype		
Email		
Partner 2		
Name	Be Yin	
Organisation	Tencent	
Role within IWT Project	Support the implementation of activities related to internet industry	
Address		
Fax/Skype		
Email		
Partner 3		
Name	Wei Xiaojing	
Organisation	SF-Express	
Role within IWT Project	Support the implementation of activities related to express industry	
Address		
Fax/Skype		
Email		

# Annex 4 Onwards - supplementary material (optional but encouraged as evidence of project achievement)

### **Checklist for submission**

	Check
Is the report less than 10MB? If so, please email to <a href="https://www.lwt.number.n&lt;/td&gt;&lt;td&gt;&lt;/td&gt;&lt;/tr&gt;&lt;tr&gt;&lt;td&gt;Is your report more than 10MB? If so, please discuss with &lt;a href=" https:="" td="" www.lwt.number.num<=""><td></td></a>	
Have you included means of verification? You need not submit every project document, but the main outputs and a selection of the others would strengthen the report.	
Do you have hard copies of material you want to submit with the report? If so, please make this clear in the covering email and ensure all material is marked with the project number.	
Have you involved your partners in preparation of the report and named the main contributors	
Have you completed the Project Expenditure table fully?	
Do not include claim forms or other communications with this report.	1